

EFFECT OF PRIVATE PATRIARCHY ON SPATIAL MOBILITY IN URBAN WOMEN TEACHERS AND STUDENTS

Fatima Saeed Bhutta¹ and Sara Rizvi Jafree²

ABSTRACT

It is generally assumed that urban women, who are enrolled in higher educational institutes or working in paid jobs outside the home, do not face challenges from private patriarchy, and instead have full control of their mobility and decision-making. However, this is not true. This study aims to understand the experiences of urban women university students and teachers, and if private patriarchy influences their spatial mobility. Restricted spatial mobility in women impacts not just the opportunities available to them with regards education and employment, but also negatively influences women's ability to seek healthcare and leisure. A survey was developed by the researchers and convenience sampling was used during the COVID-19 lockdown to sample 200 women. Multiple linear regression results revealed that private patriarchy emerged as a significant negative predictor of spatial mobility ($R^2 = F(1, 198) = 60.06, p < .001$). Furthermore, women belonging to families with lower household income face greater barriers to spatial mobility. The study implies need for social interventions and safety laws to support spatial mobility in urban women, who are working and studying in higher education, and other women groups who may be completely restricted to the homes. This is important not just for education and employment, but for the overall capacity building of women and their capability to move freely in society without barriers and fear.

Keywords: *Spatial mobility, private patriarchy, urban women, Pakistan, teachers, university students*

1. INTRODUCTION

1.1 Private Patriarchy and Spatial Mobility of Women

Post World War II and the loss of so many male soldiers and civilians, women began to enter the workforce across the world due to financial necessity (Goldin, 1991). Entry into the workforce also helped women globally to gain social acceptance for higher educational opportunities (Rose, 1991). However, even with entry into the workplace and the gaining of specialized

¹Research Assistant, Department of Sociology, Forman Christian College (A Chartered University), Lahore, Pakistan. Email: fatimasaeed99@yahoo.com

²Associate Professor and Chair, Department of Sociology, Forman Christian College (A Chartered University), Lahore, Pakistan. ORCID: <https://orcid.org/0000-0001-5141-1107>, Email: sarajafree@fccollege.edu.pk

degrees, women have been known to suffer from glass ceilings and informal employment (Bain & Cummings, 2000). Women Movements across the world have made efforts to understand the challenges women face preventing them from realizing their full potential in society and the economy (Beckwith, 2001). In the last few decades, international development organizations have built pressure for governments across the world to plan concrete measures to ensure equality of women for education and at the workplace. In fact, the Sustainable Development Goals has specific goals targeted to improve equality for women with regard to access to education and workplace rights (Koehler, 2016). However, much of the focus has been on attempting to enroll women in educational institutes and make them part of the economy, without recognition that there may be family-level barriers which restricts women's equal opportunities (Lau, 2010).

Family-level barriers or private patriarchy is known to restrict women's spatial mobility considerably, even when they are given permission to study at higher education institutes and join the workforce. Whereas the literal meaning of the word patriarchy is '*the rule of the father*' (Akgul, 2017), and implies that men are in power and have control over women's lives and decision-making; private patriarchy is more specifically defined as male members of the household dominating and subjugating the females of the family. Within the family unit, it is usually the fathers and husbands who are considered the head of the family and majority of the decisions are taken by them, including small and large decisions related to purchasing, education, family planning, healthcare, and marriage (Majlesi, 2016). Spatial mobility is the movement of a person across different locations in society, so they are able to acquire cultural capital and network for better opportunities (Yoon & Kim, 2018). Ultimately, the extent of private patriarchy experienced by a woman influences how efficiently she can move in society to gain advantages for a better life and overall wellbeing.

Since private patriarchy is usually associated with the home and family, it is assumed that when women gain permission for higher education or start working outside the home, they leave the clutches of patriarchy behind. This is not true. Many women who are in higher education or working are in fact known to face restrictions pertaining to the number of hours they can remain outside the home, and the distance they are allowed to travel for study or work (Adisa et al., 2019). International literature confirms that low spatial mobility in working women prevents them from being able to choose better job options and instead having to opt for employment that is nearest to their home (Hanson & Pratt, 1991). Other scholarship confirms that for women seeking specialization and skill development, low spatial mobility acts as a barrier to

them travelling to better institutions and skill development centers located far from the house or those that are in another city (Zhao, 2016).

Restrictions to spatial mobility also encourages women to limit their time outside the home, thus neglecting all other needs related to their wellbeing, such as: (i) travelling for accessing health services and seeking early preventive care, (ii) engaging in leisure and social support activities like visiting parks or friends, (iii) being able to visit the market for basic necessities or other shopping needs and having sufficient time to buy the best products after proper survey; and (iv) generally having time for private time outside the home and self-care (Porter, 2011). Women who are single or orphans without male guardians are known to especially suffer as they do not have male guardians to travel with them or accompany them to and from educational institutes or the workplace (Siwach, 2020). The primary population groups that are known to restrict women's spatial mobility include the spouse, father, brothers, and elderly household members like the father-in-law and mother-in-law (Carrim & Ahmed, 2016; Khan, 2011).

Interestingly, scholarship suggests that women from Muslim nations (Sholkamy, 2010) and non-Muslim nations (Shin, 2011) face considerable barriers to spatial mobility and that this is not a phenomena reserved for women from conservative or Muslim nations alone. Overall, it is not just the women who suffer from restricted spatial mobility, but as their capabilities are compromised, it is their family, children, and the economy which experiences losses. For example, women with low spatial mobility have less agency and experience to travel for their children's health needs or contribute their full potential for the national economy. Given the costs of depriving women of spatial mobility, we must ask ourselves why women are still plagued by private patriarchy and spatial mobility barriers in contemporary days. We will discuss the reasons for this, before moving to Pakistan-specific literature.

Firstly, working women still face restrictions to spatial mobility due to conservative norms and unsymmetrical household burden which necessitates that women must remain in or near their homes (Sholkamy, 2010). Traditional families believe that when women are too mobile, it negatively impacts the efficient management of the family and childcare responsibilities. Though financial necessity may require women to work outside the home, there is pressure from the family to work close to the home and also to return to the house as soon as possible to manage the needs of the children and house (Kandiyoti, 1988). In Muslim nations, there is the concern that religious interpretations justify restrictions in spatial mobility (Schenk et al., 2022). Across the world, and even in developed and advanced nations, women are known to suffer from unsymmetrical role burden, leading to time poverty,

which also restricts their spatial mobility (Giurge et al., 2020). It is important to note that time poverty in women is also influenced by hidden private patriarchy and a family structure which does not support equal work distribution.

A third major reason for why patriarchal forces restrict spatial mobility in women is the low safety and security in public spaces (Loukaitou-Sideris, 2014). The political and legal systems in patriarchal states operate in a way which favors men's agency, mobility, and safety. Women are not known to be safe in public spaces, at education institutes, or at the workplaces compared to men (Mir-Hosseini, 2006). In many countries of the world, the judiciary and security does not prioritize women's safe movement in society and instead the responsibility of a woman's safety is considered the domain of male family members. In turn, male members of the family attempt to secure the safety of their women by restricting their mobility. Thus, when women are allowed to study or work outside the home, the location and movement remains under control of the male guardians (Choudhury, 2013). Lastly, some studies argue that women themselves prefer to restrict their mobility in order to avoid gender discrimination and harassment from men outside the homes or at the workplace (Kiaye & Singh, 2013). Lack of comfort and security compels women to study or work within or near their home and opt for limited opportunities, even if their male guardians may allow them to be mobile (Xheneti et al., 2019). In fact, majority women in the South Asian region prefer to study and work from the home or online as they do not feel safe traveling outside the home and using public transport (Huq-Hussain & Habiba, 2013).

Some international literature has highlighted that women from rural backgrounds face more restrictions to mobility than urban women (Ismailbekova, 2013). This is because rural women belong to more conservative societies which are underserved by the police and security officials in the country, thus making both culture and security considerable barriers to their mobility. However, recent global literature has recognized that urban women also face considerable restrictions to their mobility and that city spaces are the 'exclusive monopoly' of men (Sarma, 2017). Most urban women across the world are deprived of their citizenship rights in accessing public spaces in the city, using public transport, and travelling in the night, as urban spaces are male-dominated and unsafe for females (Beebeejaun, 2017). There are some women groups in urban spaces that face more restrictions based on their socio-demographic characteristics, such as ethnicity and wealth class. Women from lower wealth classes, minority populations, and those who reside in more unstable neighborhoods face more restrictions to their mobility (Blumenberg, 2004).

1.2 Pakistani Urban Working Women and Spatial Mobility

Pakistani society is known to be patriarchal and conservative, with males remaining dominant and in control of most decisions related to the family (Hadi, 2017). Only 25% of the women in the country are working members of the population (Asian Development Bank, 2016), and a mere 12% of women are enrolled in the tertiary sector for higher education (World Bank Data, 2022a). Furthermore, both groups of women in the country, those enrolled in higher education and engaged in paid work, face restrictions to their spatial mobility due to reasons similar to the ones faced by women in other countries, as discussed above. Religious interpretation, conservative culture, and traditional honor codes restrict the movements of women and limit their opportunities for study and work to near the home (Roomi, 2013). Even elderly women, mothers, mothers-in-law, and sisters-in-law discourage and prevent women from being mobile and working far from the home to sustain the traditional social order and family honor (Mumtaz & Salway, 2005). Women who are more mobile and active in society are considered to have lower social status and respect. Instead of passivity and preference to remain in the home are considered virtues in women. It is not just the patriarchal culture and conservatism in the country, but fear of safety which contributes to women being given lesser mobility rights compared to men in the country. Incidents of violence, abuse, and harassment against women are common in the country, and with little protection afforded by the law and state, women feel safer within the homes (Anwar et al., 2018).

Almost 37% of Pakistan's population resides in urban areas, with an estimated 40.7 million women of Pakistan living in these areas (World Bank Data, 2022b). Male domination and restrictions to spatial mobility is not just restricted to rural and remote locations of Pakistan, but also to urban spaces (Hussain & Jullandhry, 2020). Urban women of the country are known to be confined to their homes and are usually permitted to leave the house only for necessary things, such as going to schools, colleges, or work. Even though many urban women in Pakistan are attending university or working, they are picked and dropped by male family members and are pressurized to return home before sunset (Sadrudin, 2013). Most Pakistani women who leave the house for study or work are pressurized or coerced by family to: (i) adopt *Pardah* (veiling) and remain modest in dressing and interactions (Ali, 2000); (ii) study or work for limited hours and return before sunset (Hussain, 2009); and (iii) attend segregated universities or accept feminized professions, and study or work with only female colleagues. Local research also confirms that educated and urban women face serious hurdles and permission barriers in accessing health services outside the home from family and in-laws due to

patriarchal traditions of associating honor with women remaining within the home (Saeed & Farooq, 2017).

A local research highlights that women from middle and lower class backgrounds of Pakistan both face considerable barriers to mobility, but that upper class women comparatively face less barriers (Mumtaz, 2005). Overall, women have lower mobility when they do not have a male relative to travel with them, and they feel anxious and fearful when travelling alone due to cultural pressure and safety issues. As a result, many women prefer to remain within the home and opt for life choices, such as working and studying near the home or only going out of the home when accompanied by male relatives, so as not to compromise their social position. It is commonly observed in the country that women are not allowed to attend training and co-curricular activities, socialize with peers or colleagues, and travel for their jobs or research projects. It is this restricted spatial mobility which prevents women from gaining the best specializations, gaining the most competitive employment positions, and assuming positions of governance (Zakar et al., 2013). The public sector, political offices, and public spaces have very little representation of women, as these jobs require travel and longer or erratic work hours (Chauhan, 2014).

With rising economic challenges and the need for dual-income earners in the family, there is concern that women must be provided adequate support to gain the best specialization and employment opportunities (Roomi, 2013). Furthermore, when women are restricted by spatial mobility and having to take on less preferred degree and employment options, they suffer from high dissatisfaction and role commitment (Magdol, 2002). Lack of optimal participation in the educational sector and the workforce is a problem for women, their families, and the economy. There is need for more local research to understand if urban women in Pakistan are facing barriers to their mobility in order to advise policy for their support, improved agency, and overall wellbeing. This is also important if Pakistan is to meet its targets for the Sustainable Development Goals and build a workforce that equally contributes to the development of the country.

1.3 Theoretical Framework

Marxist Feminists, like Acker, have suggested that women may be given some concessions to study and work outside the home, but only so they can contribute to family income (Acker, 1989). It is argued that despite specialized degrees and employment women still remain disempowered in terms of restrictions on their mobility, the distance they can travel, and how long they can remain outside the home. Amartya Sen's Capability Theory has

been used as a theoretical framework for this study (Sen, 2005), as it is able to extend feminist theory in a way that better elaborates women's challenges from a South Asian perspective which has regional relevancy. Capability Theory elaborates that it is not just participation in the educational institute or paid work that ensures wellbeing of women, but that there are other factors which are important to develop a women's agency and overall capacity. In context to this study, we derive that when women do not have control over all their decisions, this negatively affects their wellbeing. We cannot assume that a woman who is given permission and support to join university or paid employment outside the home will necessarily have all the benefits of capacity building.

Private patriarchy may not give a women the autonomy to choose her area of specialization, or the best university because it is located in another city. Similarly, she may not be allowed to live on campus or study in the library or with peers, all of which can affect her learning and agency. When it comes to working women, again, we cannot assume that a woman who is allowed to join the workforce outside the home, has all the benefits of autonomous decision-making. A woman, due to restrictions on mobility, may be compelled to take a job that does not suit her interests or reward her according to her abilities. A woman's spatial mobility is extremely important as it gives her power over her actions and practices (Kynch & Sen, 1983). The powerlessness of spatial immobility in women also negatively affects her advocacy and ability to fight for her rights, or seek legal recourse when a violation has occurred. In a similar vein, Sen also discusses private patriarchy and the complexity of women having to engage in paid work and higher education, without being provided symmetrical household assistance (Ferguson & Folbre, 2020). This means that women have very little time for using the limited time and permission they have outside the home, for self-care, or for health needs.

1.4 Rationale of the Study

It is assumed that urban women who are enrolled at university or teaching would face no barriers to decision-making and spatial mobility from private patriarchy. However, international and local literature suggests otherwise. Despite the literature, there is almost no empirical research in Pakistan about the experiences of urban women university students and teachers regarding their experiences of private patriarchy and spatial mobility. The aim of this study is to collect empirical data to ascertain the relationship between patriarchy and spatial mobility of urban women in Lahore, Pakistan. It is important to consider that urban women university students and teachers who may face patriarchal barriers to mobility, may also face extended

problems related to autonomous decision-making for preferred specialization and employment, ability to gain healthcare and leisure opportunities, and overall gain capacity building opportunities for overall wellbeing. Most research on women in Pakistan centers around investigating the problems and challenges of rural women, women who are not working, or females not enrolled in schools. There is need for researchers to contribute to the challenges facing urban women of Pakistan, who constitute a large population of over 40 million women, and those who are working and enrolled in specialized degrees. This is because private patriarchy is not dead, and conservative and male dominated culture in the country may be hampering independent decision-making, mobility, and wellbeing of women. Based on the study findings, culturally relevant recommendations will be presented on needed reforms to support women university students and teachers, with regards to decision-making rights and spatial mobility.

1.5 Objective of the Study

The objective of this study is to understand:

1. The relationship between private patriarchy and spatial mobility of urban women university students and teachers.
2. If the socio-demographic variable of household income has a significant relationship with spatial mobility in women.

1.6 Hypotheses of the Study

The hypotheses of this study include:

1. There will be a statistically positive relationship between private patriarchy and spatial mobility of urban women university students and teachers.
2. Women from higher wealth class will face less challenges and barriers to spatial mobility.

2. METHODOLOGY

This is a cross-sectional study, using a quantitative survey-design. Ethics clearance was taken from Institutional Review Board, Forman Christian College (A Chartered University). Participants were provided information about the study objectives and informed consent was taken before the start of data collection. It was ensured that no names of participants were recorded, and the survey responses have been stored safely by the first author. Participants were not pressurized in any way to participate in the study, and they were informed of the right to withdraw at any point during the survey.

2.1 Sample

The selection criterion was limited to: (i) urban women university students who were currently studying, and (ii) urban women teachers who were currently employed. Only women students above the age of 18 years were sampled.

2.2 Data Collection

Data was collected during the COVID-19 pandemic and partial lockdown. Due to the pandemic lockdown convenience sampling method was adopted and to maintain social distancing a Google Survey was used. The Google Survey settings were assigned to ensure that no personal information of any participant was recorded. Teachers and students were messaged directly to ensure that the select sample responded. The following Facebook groups were used to sample teachers: i. Teachers' Professional Development Programmes in Pakistan; ii. Punjab Teachers Group (PTG); and iii. Pakistan Teacher's Group. The following women's student societies from different universities were approached through their Facebook groups to sample female university students: i. Women Empowerment Society FCCU; ii. President Kinnaird Society 2021-2022; and iii. Student Council-Lahore College for Women University. In addition, we sampled through: (i) personal contacts, (ii) publicly accessible university websites which had displayed teacher email addresses, and (iii) WhatsApp groups of university students. We were finally able to collect data from 200 willing respondents online. Though the survey was circulated over a three month period, from August to October 2021, the response was low. We believe the low response was due to: (i) pandemic anxiety, (ii) low response generally for online surveys, and (iii) hectic and novel routine for teachers and university students who were juggling online and hybrid teaching.

2.3 Measuring Private Patriarchy and Spatial Mobility in Women Respondents

The survey for this study was developed by the authors in order to meet the objectives of the study and so questions related to the regional and cultural context could be included. To measure private patriarchy, we included six questions related to: decision-making control; obedience to father compared to mother; seeking permission from male member of household for movement outside the house; pressure to commit primarily to domestic work; and autonomy in dressing.

To measure spatial mobility, we included nine questions related to: permission to leave home alone; comparison of mobility patterns with male

members of family; not being given permission to visit, work or study after sunset or if destination is far from home or in another city; tendency to shop online rather than visit market; and getting into trouble for leaving home without a male family member. A 5-point Likert scale was used ranging from strongly agree (score 5) to strongly disagree (score 1), with responses of a higher score indicating higher experience with private patriarchy and lesser spatial mobility in women.

2.4 Data Analysis

For this study the independent variable was 'private patriarchy' and the dependent variable was 'spatial mobility of women'. To analyze the data the statistical software Statistical Package for Social Sciences 25.0 was used. Factor analysis was used to test the construct validity of the scale. Normality and reliability was also checked. Next, descriptive statistics were derived, and Spearman correlation was used to check the relationship between the independent and dependent variables. Finally linear regression and multiple regression were tested for both the variables. Significance levels of $p < 0.05$ were considered significant for this study.

3. RESULTS

3.1 Socio-Demographic Results

Table 1 presents the socio-demographic information of the women participants. Majority (62.0%) of the women are currently single. Majority of the sample included teachers (67.5%) and we found that they were more responsive than students on Google Survey. Most women belonged to families

Table 1. Descriptive Statistics of Socio-Demographic Data (N=200).

Variables	F	%
Age (M=29.45; SD=9.38)		
Marital Status		
Single	124	62.0
Married	69	34.5
Divorced	04	02.0
Separated	03	01.5
Occupation		
Female university students	65	32.5
School/ University Teachers	135	67.5
Household Income		
Less than PKR 200,000	96	48.0
More than PKR 200,000	104	52.0

that had a household income of above PKR 200,000 (52.0%), making the sample representative of the urban middle class of Pakistan.

3.2 Factor Analysis

Table 2 presents the factor analysis of the six items that measured the variable private patriarchy. The factor loading for patriarchy items were all greater than or closer to the value 0.5 except question number 6.

Table 2. Factor Analysis of Items in Private Patriarchy Scale.

	Initial	Extraction
Most of the household decisions are made by the male member(s) of the family	1.000	.480
I obey my father more than I do my mother	1.000	.907
I cannot leave my house until my father or husband give me permission	1.000	.553
I am expected to focus more on the domestic work than studies/employment	1.000	.522
I have to listen to the final decision made by my father or husband	1.000	.632
I dress according to what my father or husband tells me	1.000	.216

Table 3 shows the factor analysis of the nine items that measured spatial mobility of the participants. The result shows that all the items were greater or closer to the value 0.5.

Table 3. Factor Analysis of Items in Spatial Mobility Scale

	Initial	Extraction
I make plans with my friends less often as compared to my brother or male cousins	1.000	.434
I can get in trouble if I leave house without a male family member	1.000	.485
I have to return to my house before sunset	1.000	.597
A male member of the family accompanies me if I have to travel out of the city	1.000	.544
I had to choose the university/workplace that is near my house	1.000	.455
I do not have permission to visit friends or cousins homes regularly	1.000	.566
I cannot take a job/courses which require post sunset hours	1.000	.527
I am less likely to go outside my house unless it is very important	1.000	.653
I do more online shopping as it is hard for me to leave the house	1.000	.460

Table 4 presents the normality and reliability of both the dependent (private patriarchy) and independent (spatial mobility) variables. Shapiro-Wilk

Test was run to test the normality for the distribution of data for both the study variables (private patriarchy and spatial mobility). The data was normally distributed for mobility as the values of skewness and kurtosis were within the range. The Cronbach’s value for private patriarchy was a little less than 0.7. The value for spatial mobility was above the recommended value of 0.7.

Table 4. Psychometric Properties of Study Variables.

Variables	M	SD	S Error	Range	Skewness	Kurtosis	Cronbach’s alpha
Private Patriarchy	.206	4.933	.05813	-12-12	1.138	8.990	.655
Spatial Mobility	-.290	6.769	.05318	-18-18	.076	-.279	.817

3.3 Spearmen correlation results

Table 5 shows the spearmen correlation results of private patriarchy and spatial mobility. According to the results private patriarchy has a significant negative relationship with spatial mobility. This means that as patriarchy increases the spatial mobility of women in the sample decreases.

Table 5. Spearmen Correlation Results showing Relationship between Private Patriarchy and Spatial Mobility.

-Variables	N	1	2
Patriarchy	200	-	
Mobility	200	-.56***	-

3.4 Regression Results

Table 6 reports the linear regression results for the study. The predictor variable patriarchy was entered and the regression model was significant with results showing: $R^2 = .23$, $F(1, 198) = 60.06$ $p < .001$. The study domain private patriarchy emerged as a significant negative predictor of spatial mobility, indicating that when private patriarchy is high, women teachers and university students face barriers to spatial mobility.

Table 6. Simple Linear Regression Analysis of Patriarchy and Spatial Mobility.

Predictors	B	95% CI for B		SEB	B	R ²	ΔR ²
		LL	CL				
Step 1						.23***	.23***
Constant	-.20	-.29	-.10	.05			
Patriarchy	-.44	-.55	-.33	.06	-.48***		

Table 7 presents the multiple regression model for the dependent variable spatial mobility with the independent variables of the study, including: age, marital status, occupation, and household income. The prediction model was statistically significant, $F(4,195) = 2.52, p=.043, R^2 = .05^*$. The model suggests that the lower the household income the less the spatial mobility in women. Vice versa, the higher the household income the more the spatial mobility experienced by women.

Table 7. Multiple Regression Model for Spatial Mobility.

Variables	Unstandardized co-efficient		Standardized co-efficient		95% CI for β	
	B	Std. Error	B	Sig	Lower Bound	Upper Bound
(Constant)	-.73	.29		.012	-1.31	-.16
Age	-.004	.008	-.05	.61	-.02	.01
Marital status	-.011	.12	-.009	.93	-.24	.22
Occupation	-.020	.05	-.03	.72	-.13	.09
Household Income	.25	.09	.21	.004	.08	.42

Dependent Variable: Spatial Mobility
The Prediction model was statistically significant, $F(4,195)=2.52,p=.043, R^2 = .05^*$

4. DISCUSSION

The purpose of this study was to find a relationship between private patriarchy and spatial mobility in urban teachers and university students of Pakistan. A self-constructed questionnaire was used to measure both the study variables of private patriarchy and spatial mobility. Factor analysis results showed that the scales are reliable to measure the domains for women in Pakistan and can be used by other researchers. Regression results showed that the first hypothesis of the study is correct, and women teachers and women university students in Pakistan who experience more patriarchy in the home, have restricted spatial mobility. Other studies from Pakistan corroborate our results to an extent. One local study from Pakistan’s federal capital confirmed that female students have restricted mobility, however it also reported that working women had more mobility in comparison (Ferdoos & Zahra, 2016). Our study has sampled currently working teachers and we find that they, compared to other working women in Pakistan, face greater spatial mobility barriers. The teaching job is considered as a noble and conservative occupation in Pakistan (Nadeem et al., 2011), and thus it might be that women from more conservative and patriarchal families are found in the teaching profession.

Another local research also confirms our findings in that majority of women do not have permission for decision making, spending their own money, and spatial mobility (Hussain, 2020). Despite the 21st century and permission to work and participate in higher education, Pakistani women still face traditional and patriarchal barriers to spatial mobility (Ali & Haq, 2006). This is perhaps because Pakistani society is at cross-roads of having to provide opportunities to its women, for education and employment, but is still attempting to maintain cultural traditions associated with keeping women domesticated as much as possible (Adeel & Yeh, 2017). It is also true that too much mobility and movement is associated with compromising the family honor. Even successful women entrepreneurs are facing restrictions on social mobility, coupled with having to face shaming for being active and creative (Mahmood et al., 2012). In this way, many women attempt to work within the home, near their homes, and in traditionally accepted professions, such as teaching, so they do not face cultural shame or family disapproval.

The second hypothesis of our study is also proven correct, and our results show that increased spatial mobility is associated with women belonging to higher income households. Another local study confirms that women who belong to upper social classes are more mobile (Adeel et al., 2018). However, one local research suggests that regardless of social class and household income, women in Pakistan face restricted mobility (Rizvi et al., 2014). Our results imply that Pakistani women from lower income households face considerable barriers to spatial mobility, which can negatively affect their future opportunities and capacity building. Furthermore, such barriers may compromise not just where they can travel for work and studies, but also their ability to gain access to health, leisure, and social support. Studies confirm that women who face restrictions on mobility, are unable to gain better opportunities for income generation and professional advancement, and thus may suffer from multiple problems such as job dissatisfaction, low self-esteem, and low self-efficacy (Jaim, 2020). It is also true that women who experience less spatial mobility, have less experience and initiative in autonomously pursuing and engaging in society when emergencies take place. Pakistan is facing immense challenges related to climate change and environmental disasters, with women expected to play active roles in recovery (Habib et al., 2022). Thus, improving spatial mobility of women is also important for the country so it can recover more efficiently from natural disasters and emergencies.

The results of this study are also important as they highlight that urban women in Pakistan still face private patriarchy. If urban women who are given permission to teach and study in higher educational institutes face issues

related to low decision-making power and low spatial mobility, the implications for the majority rural and remote women dwellers of the country are immense. An estimated 60% of Pakistan's women reside in rural areas and the urban population is also rising at a high rate. Thus, both rural and urban women need interventions and support for improved decision-making and spatial mobility, not just to support their income-earning potential, but their overall wellbeing and agency and so they can make decisions and remain mobile for health-seeking, leisure-seeking, and self-care.

The growth and development of Pakistan is dependent on gender sensitive planning, which needs to be mainstreamed into every sector of rural and urban policy planning (Punzo et al., 2021). This includes mobility planning and decision-making planning for women, as the evidence from this research confirms. As women in the country become empowered for spatial mobility, they will be able to make better decisions for themselves and their family, and overall lead better quality of lives. Furthermore, the agency and capacity building provided by spatial mobility in women, benefits a nation's growth in production and innovation. To date, Pakistan lacks comprehensive data about spatial mobility patterns of different women groups across its provinces and has neglected to consider concrete planning to improve mobility in women. Based on this study's findings, it is underscored that future policy planning in the country must consider: (i) sustainable mobility for women in the country through a cultural lens and in respect of conservative culture, (ii) cooperation across other sectors, such as the legal and security system in the country and the transport sector, which can facilitate safe mobility for women; and (iii) involvement of family, community notables, and religious leaders who are important in influencing support for women's mobility.

4.1 Limitations

There are some limitations of this study, including the convenience sampling design, which was necessary during the ongoing COVID-19 pandemic. It may also be that we have over-sampled women who use the internet and are comfortable in answering Google Survey, thus excluding women who are not users of social media. Another limitation is that we chose to develop our own scale, as we could not find a scale suited to what we were trying to research. For future research it is recommended that a bigger and randomized sample is taken and women from other urban spaces of Pakistan are sampled. In addition, we chose to sample female teachers and university students, and the results may be different for urban women working in other professional sectors of the country or women who are attending colleges.

5. CONCLUSION

This study finds a relationship between private patriarchy and restricted mobility of urban women in Pakistan. It adds to the literature by contributing that the urban women university students and teachers of Pakistan face private patriarchy which affects their spatial mobility. Pakistan needs to introduce critical interventions in the urban regions for women's mobility in order to secure equal opportunities and wellbeing of women. There is also need for greater support of spatial mobility in lower class and disadvantaged women of the country, as they suffer more restrictions and barriers. Family-level awareness is a key to diffuse the patriarchal barriers, but macro-level structural interventions are also needed to improve safety for women in public spaces and the workplace. This is because patriarchal tendencies to restrict women's movement in the country are heavily dominated by safety concerns. Pakistan needs to move away from the culture, where only male relatives are assumed to be guardians of women. Agents that must be held accountable by law to guarantee the safety of women in the country include the police, security officers, and employers. In the next decade, the women of Pakistan need to emerge as competitive and successful human resources for the growth of the country, and they will not be able to do this without support for their spatial mobility. When men and women do not have equal claim to the geographical space, occupational space, and specialization space in the city, and their movements are controlled by patriarchy, holding a degree and a job position become meaningless. Gender equality is about capacity building and capability development, and thus independent decision-making and spatial mobility are important precursors for equality and progress not just of women, but of a nation.

6. RECOMMENDATIONS

Family-level awareness is needed in Pakistan about the importance of autonomous decision-making and spatial mobility and the benefits of granting women mobility so they can pursue capacity building, health services, and leisure opportunities (Jafree, 2020). These family-level awareness sessions must include male members of the family, the elders, and also community notables. The awareness sessions would benefit by being led by both male and female facilitators and using case-studies to present success stories of women who were granted spatial mobility rights in the country. Though we cannot be certain of the death of patriarchy anytime soon, we can work on behavior change literacy targeted to improve family-level support for women's mobility. This behavior change literacy must start from gender sensitization campaigns in schools and colleges with male students and must include community level

awareness and social media awareness campaigns. The role of TV, movies, and radio is immense in improving awareness and support for women's mobility and overall status.

Pakistan is also in need of improved safety and protective laws which will make women feel safe and encourage male relatives to give women the freedom to remain mobile (Jafree, 2018). Institutional laws and zero tolerance for harassment and abuse, at the workplace and educational institutes, would also ensure improvement in mobility of women in the country. The deployment of women protection officers across streets, public transport routes, and at university campuses and employment centers would help in improving the culture of safety and encouraging male relatives to allow women to travel alone. The development of mobile Apps which track the movement of women and help family members and security officials to keep women safe and track perpetrators can also help in improving mobility of women.

There is also need for greater consideration about labor legislation, female labor laws, female labor unions, and female student unions which can help to improve agency and safety for women. Women unions and female labor laws are known to improve safety and security of women and improve support for family-level or workplace harassment faced by women. Finally, it is recommended that separate public transport like exclusive buses and rickshaws for women should be introduced and made available for all women population groups across the urban spaces. At the moment there are critical shortages of the pink transport and transport services dedicated just for women in urban cities of Pakistan (Starkey et al., 2021). All universities and employment centers should provide safe transport dedicated just for women, preferably with women drivers and conductors, which would also help safe transport and encourage permission for mobility of women.

REFERENCES

- Acker, J. (1989). The problem with patriarchy. *Sociology*, 23(2), 235-240.
- Adeel, M., & Yeh, A. G. (2018). Gendered immobility: influence of social roles and local context on mobility decisions in Pakistan. *Transportation planning and technology*, 41(6), 660-678.
- Adeel, M., Yeh, A. G., & Zhang, F. (2017). Gender inequality in mobility and mode choice in Pakistan. *Transportation*, 44(6), 1519-1534.
- Adisa, T. A., Cooke, F. L., & Iwowo, V. (2019). Mind your attitude: the impact of patriarchy on women's workplace behaviour. *Career Development International*.
- Akgul, F. (2017). Understanding Patriarchy. In *Patriarchal Theory Reconsidered* (pp. 29-65). Palgrave Macmillan, Cham.

- Ali, S. M., & ul Haq, R. (2006). Women's autonomy and happiness: the case of Pakistan. *The Pakistan Development Review*, 121-136. Retrieved from <https://www.jstor.org/stable/41260738?seq=1>
- Ali, K. (2000). Structural Adjustment policies and women in the labour market: Urban working women in Pakistan. *Third world planning review*, 22(1), 1.
- Anwar, N. H., Viqar, S., & Mustafa, D. (2018). Intersections of gender, mobility, and violence in urban Pakistan. In *Social Theories of Urban Violence in the Global South* (pp. 15-31). Routledge.
- Asian Development Bank (2016) Policy brief on female labor force participation in Pakistan. <https://www.adb.org/sites/default/files/publication/209661/female-labor-force-participation-pakistan.pdf>
- Bain, O., & Cummings, W. (2000). Academe's glass ceiling: Societal, professional-organizational, and institutional barriers to the career advancement of academic women. *Comparative education review*, 44(4), 493-514.
- Beckwith, K. (2001). Women's movements at century's end: Excavation and advances in political science. *Annual Review of Political Science*, 4(1), 371-390.
- Beebejaun, Y. (2017). Gender, urban space, and the right to everyday life. *Journal of Urban Affairs*, 39(3), 323-334.
- Blumenberg, E. (2004). En-gendering effective planning: spatial mismatch, low-income women, and transportation policy. *Journal of the American Planning Association*, 70(3), 269-281.
- Carrim, N. M., & Ahmed, S. F. (2016). Indian husbands' support of their wives' upward mobility in corporate South Africa: Wives' perspectives. *SA Journal of Industrial Psychology*, 42(1), 1-13. <https://doi.org/10.4102/sajip.v42i1.1354>
- Chauhan, K. (2014). Gender Inequality: The Effect of Patriarchy. In *Gender Inequality in the Public Sector in Pakistan* (pp. 133-154). Palgrave Macmillan, New York. Retrieved from https://doi.org/10.1057/9781137426475_6
- Choudhury, T. (2013). Experiences of women as workers: A study of construction workers in Bangladesh. *Construction Management and Economics*, 31(8), 883-898. Retrieved from <https://doi.org/10.1080/01446193.2012.756143>
- Ferdoos, A., & Zahra, M. S. (2016). Patriarchy and Decision Making Power of Women. *Journal of Gender and Social Issues*, 15(2), 55-68. Retrieved from <https://web.a.ebscohost.com/abstract?direct=true&profile=ehost&scope=site&authtype=crawler&jrnl=18139892&AN=123977987>

- &h=PUIDpDLcP98v1MtYniWT351WC6OU%2boVAYFhNBM1t0oDAcl
 bk%2fRmid4ZmNkeYwJ%2fY8xM3We%2bBvBTftQbrmjHxMQQ%3d%
 3d&crl=c&resultNs=AdminWebAuth&result
- Ferguson, A., & Folbre, N. (2020). Women, care, and the public good: A dialogue. In *Not for Sale* (pp. 95-107). Routledge.
- Goldin, C. D. (1991). The role of World War II in the rise of women's employment. *The American Economic Review*, 741-756.
- Giurge, L. M., Whillans, A. V., & West, C. (2020). Why time poverty matters for individuals, organisations and nations. *Nature Human Behaviour*, 4(10), 993-1003.
- Habib, N., Alauddin, M., & Cramb, R. (2022). What defines livelihood vulnerability to climate change in rain-fed, rural regions? A qualitative study of men's and women's vulnerability to climate change in Pakistan's Punjab. *Cogent Social Sciences*, 8(1), 2054152.
- Hadi, A. (2017). Patriarchy and gender-based violence in Pakistan. *European Journal of Social Science Education and Research*, 4(4), 289-296.
- Hanson, S., & Pratt, G. (1991). Job search and the occupational segregation of women. *Annals of the Association of American geographers*, 81(2), 229-253.
- Huq-Hussain, S., & Habiba, U. (2013). Gendered experiences of mobility: travel behavior of middle-class women in Dhaka City. *Transfers*, 3(3), 79-98. Retrieved from <https://doi.org/10.3167/TRANS.2013.030306>
- Hussain, S., & Jullandhry, S. (2020). Are urban women empowered in Pakistan? A study from a metropolitan city. In *Women's Studies International Forum* (Vol. 82, p. 102390). Pergamon. Retrieved from <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.wsif.2020.102390>
- Hussain, I. (2009). *Problems of working women in Karachi, Pakistan*. Cambridge Scholars Publishing.
- Ismailbekova, A. (2013). Migration and patrilineal descent: the effects of spatial male mobility on social female mobility in rural Kyrgyzstan. Retrieved from <http://hdl.handle.net/20.500.11811/136>
- Jafree, S. R. (2018). *Women, healthcare, and violence in Pakistan*. Oxford University Press.
- Jafree, S. R. (Ed.). (2020). *The Sociology of South Asian Women's Health*. Springer Nature.
- Jaim, J. (2020). All About Patriarchal Segregation of Work Regarding Family? Women Business-Owners in Bangladesh. *Journal of Business Ethics*, 1-15. Retrieved from <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10551-020-04619-w>.
- Kandiyoti, D. (1988). Bargaining with patriarchy. *Gender & Society*, 2(3), 274-290.

- Khan, S. (2011). Gendered leisure: are women more constrained in travel for leisure? *Tourismos*, 6(1). Retrieved from https://www.researchgate.net/profile/Khan-Sonia/publication/50418223_Gendered_leisure_Are_women_more_constrained_in_travel_for_leisure/links/5b84f09b92851c1e1236d98a/Gendered-leisure-Are-women-more-constrained-in-travel-for-leisure.pdf
- Kiaye, R. E., & Singh, A. M. (2013). The glass ceiling: a perspective of women working in Durban. *Gender in Management: An international journal*. Retrieved from <https://doi.org/10.1108/17542411311301556>
- Koehler, G. (2016). Tapping the Sustainable Development Goals for progressive gender equity and equality policy?. *Gender & Development*, 24(1), 53-68.
- Kynch, J., & Sen, A. (1983). Indian women: well-being and survival. *Cambridge journal of economics*, 7(3/4), 363-380.
- Lau, L. (2010). Literary Representations of the 'New Indian Woman' The Single, Working, Urban, Middle Class Indian Woman Seeking Personal Autonomy. *Journal of South Asian Development*, 5(2), 271-292.
- Loukaitou-Sideris, A. (2014). Fear and safety in transit environments from the women's perspective. *Security journal*, 27(2), 242-256.
- Magdol, L. (2002). Is moving gendered? The effects of residential mobility on the psychological well-being of men and women. *Sex roles*, 47(11), 553-560.
- Majlesi, K. (2016). Labor market opportunities and women's decision making power within households. *Journal of Development Economics*, 119, 34-47.
- Mahmood, B., Sohail, M. M., Khalid, S., & Babak, I. (2012). Gender specific barriers to female entrepreneurs in Pakistan: A study in urban areas of Pakistan. *British Journal of Education, Society and Behavioural Science*, 2(4), 339-352. Retrieved from <https://doi.org/10.9734/BJESBS/2012/2128>
- Mumtaz, Z., & Salway, S. (2005). 'I never go anywhere': extricating the links between women's mobility and uptake of reproductive health services in Pakistan. *Social science & medicine*, 60(8), 1751-1765.
- Nadeem, M., Rana, M. S., Lone, A. H., Maqbool, S., Naz, K., & Akhtar, A. (2011). Teacher's Competencies And Factors Affecting The Performance Of Female Teachers In Bahawalpur (Southern Punjab) Pakistan. *International Journal of Business and Social Science*, 2(19).
- Yoon, H., & Kim, H. (2018). Career-family strategies and spatial mobility among South Korean women scholars. *Asian and Pacific Migration Journal*, 27(1), 101-120. Mumtaz, Z. &. (2005). . 'I never go anywhere':

- extricating the links between women's mobility and uptake of reproductive health services in Pakistan. *Social science & medicine*, 60(8), 1751-1765. Retrieved from <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.socscimed.2004.08.019>
- Mir-Hosseini, Z. (2006). Muslim women's quest for equality: Between Islamic law and feminism. *Critical Inquiry*, 32(4), 629-645.
- Porter, G. (2011). 'I think a woman who travels a lot is befriending other men and that's why she travels': mobility constraints and their implications for rural women and girls in sub-Saharan Africa. *Gender, place and culture*, 18(01), 65-81. Retrieved from <https://doi.org/10.1080/0966369X.2011.535304>.
- Punzo, G., Panarello, D., & Castellano, R. (2021). Sustainable urban mobility: evidence from three developed European countries. *Quality & Quantity*, 1-23.
- Roomi, M. A. (2013). Entrepreneurial capital, social values and Islamic traditions: Exploring the growth of women-owned enterprises in Pakistan. *International Small Business Journal*, 31(2), 175-191.
- Rose, A. D. (1991). Preparing for veterans: Higher education and the efforts to accredit the learning of World War II servicemen and women. *Adult Education Quarterly*, 42(1), 30-45.
- Rizvi, N., S Khan, K., & Shaikh, B. T. (2014). Gender: shaping personality, lives and health of women in Pakistan. *BMC women's health*, 14(1), 1-8. Retrieved from <https://doi.org/10.1186/1472-6874-14-53>
- Saeed, A., & Farooq, S. (2017). "I Can't go out": Mobility obstacles to Women's access to HIV treatment in KPK, Pakistan. *Journal of the Association of Nurses in AIDS Care*, 28(4), 561-574. Retrieved from <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jana.2017.03.010>
- Sarma, S. (2017). Spatial mobility: A gendered phenomenon. *International Journal of Research in Social Sciences*, 7(10), 349-360.
- Schenk, C. G., Gökarkırsel, B., & Behzadi, N. E. (2022). Security, violence, and mobility: The embodied and everyday politics of negotiating Muslim femininities. *Political Geography*, 94, 102597.
- Sen, A. (2005). Human rights and capabilities. *Journal of human development*, 6(2), 151-166.
- Shin, H. (2011). Spatial capability for understanding gendered mobility for Korean Christian immigrant women in Los Angeles. *Urban studies*, 48(11), 2355-2373. Retrieved from <https://doi.org/10.1177%2F0042098010388955>.

- Sholkamy, H. (2010). Power, Politics and Development in the Arab Context: Or how can rearing chicks change patriarchy? *Development*, 53(2), 254-258.
- Siwach, P. (2020). Mapping gendered spaces and women's mobility: A case study of Mitathal Village, Haryana. *The Oriental Anthropologist*, 20(1), 33-48. Retrieved from <https://doi.org/10.1177%2F0972558X20913680>
- Starkey, P., Batool, Z., Younis, E. M. W., Rehman, A. U., & Ali, M. S. (2021). Motorcycle three-wheelers in Pakistan: Low-cost rural transport services, crucial for women's mobility. *Transportation research interdisciplinary perspectives*, 12, 100479.
- World Bank Data (2022a). Tertiary school enrollment of females in Pakistan. <https://data.worldbank.org/indicator/SE.TER.ENRR.FE?locations=PK>
- World Bank Data (2022b). Urban Population of Pakistan. <https://data.worldbank.org/indicator/SP.URB.TOTL.IN.ZS?locations=PK>.
- Xheneti, M., Karki, S. T., & Madden, A. (2019). Negotiating business and family demands within a patriarchal society—the case of women entrepreneurs in the Nepalese context. *Entrepreneurship & Regional Development*, 31(3-4), 259-278. Retrieved from <https://doi.org/10.1080/08985626.2018.1551792>
- Zakar, R., Zakar, M. Z., & Kraemer, A. (2013). Men's beliefs and attitudes toward intimate partner violence against women in Pakistan. *Violence against women*, 19(2), 246-268. Retrieved from <https://doi.org/10.1177%2F1077801213478028>