

Working Paper No: 192
**Socio-economic Inclusion of
Afghan Refugees in Pakistan**

Asif Javed, Shehryar Khan,
Rubab Syed and Vaqar Ahmad
November 2020



All rights reserved.

No part of this paper may be reproduced or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic or mechanical, including photocopying, recording or information storage and retrieval system, without prior written permission of the publisher.

A publication of the Sustainable Development Policy Institute (SDPI).

The opinions expressed in the papers are solely those of the authors, and publishing them does not in any way constitute an endorsement of the opinion by the SDPI.

Sustainable Development Policy Institute is an independent, non-profit research institute on sustainable development.

First edition: November 2020

© 2020 by the Sustainable Development Policy Institute

Mailing Address:

PO Box 2342, Islamabad, Pakistan

Telephone: 0092-51-2278134, 2278136, 2277146, 2270674-76

Fax: 0092-51-2278135,

URL: www.sdpi.org

Abstract

Pakistan hosts the largest number of Afghan refugees in the world, who have been residing here for more than three decades. Political and economic crises in Afghanistan are the major hurdles in their return to their homeland. The study looks into the socio-economic inclusion of Afghan refugees in Pakistan and examines the challenges being faced by refugees in this regard. A survey was carried out in Islamabad, Rawalpindi, Karachi, Peshawar, and Quetta to collect the quantitative and qualitative data of Afghan refugees. The response of Pakistani host community was also taken. Results indicate that Afghan refugees have lack of access to basic services, including health, education and livelihood. The Pakistani host community welcomed the Afghan refugees and cooperated with them in every possible manner.

Key words: Afghan refugees, socio-economic inclusion

Contents

1. Introduction	5
2. Literature Review	5
3. Methodology	6
4. Findings	7
5. Conclusion	19
6. Policy Recommendations	19
References	23
Annexure A	26

1. Introduction

In recent times, the world has witnessed forced displacements and internal migration triggered by armed conflict, violence and political instability (Mosel & Jackson, 2013). In most cases, the forcibly displaced people do not have the resources to move out of the region, so they remain internally displaced or move to the neighboring countries in search of livelihood. During the past decade, refugees have become the largest growing population of the world¹.

After nearly four decades of displacement, Afghans continue to constitute one of the world's largest protracted refugee population. Though many Afghan refugees have migrated to different countries, Pakistan still hosts a majority of those, who were displaced in the aftermath of 1979 invasion of Afghanistan by the Soviet forces. Pakistan is one of the world's largest host countries for refugees, including an estimated 1.4 million people that include 54% males and 46% females; nearly 60 per cent of refugees reside in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa (United Nations High Commission for Refugees 2018)². Continued violence amid political and economic turmoil in Afghanistan has discouraged refugees to return to their homeland and a continued influx of Afghans into Pakistan (Khan 2017). The refugees have little expectations from the Afghan government as they are mostly not willing to return. Pakistan's narrative on Afghans' repatriation explicitly refers to lack of livelihood opportunities and access to basic services in Afghanistan as critical factors, hampering continued repatriation. More importantly, the recent government policy on refugee repatriation had not been successful because of unfavourable political and security conditions in Afghanistan.

This study attempts to shed light on the challenges of social integration and the obstacles encountered by the refugees in pursuing livelihood opportunities in Pakistan. In doing so, the following research questions were pursued:

- What are the social and economic challenges for Afghan refugees?
- What is the state of access to social services for Afghan refugees?
- What are the aspects of social cohesion among Afghan refugees and host communities?

2. Literature Review

The 1979 Soviet intervention caused political and social unrest in Afghanistan plunging the country into a civil war (Haqqani 2005) as a result of which millions of refugees migrated to Pakistan. An estimated 2.7 million Afghans (UNHCR, 2012c) have been provided shelter in Pakistan since 1979. Refugees are residing in camps and are primarily dependent on rehabilitation assistance, community support and self-employment (Christensen 1989; Sadat, 2008 and Kucher 2005). Since 2002, at least 3.8 million refugees have returned to Afghanistan. Currently, there are three million registered and unregistered Afghan refugees; however, the number of unregistered refugees is believed to be far greater since movement

¹According to Article 1A (2) of the 1951 Convention relating to the Status of Refugees, as modified by the 1967 Protocol, a refugee is a person who, "owing to a well-founded fear of persecution for reasons of race, religion, nationality, membership of a particular social group or political opinions, is outside the country of his nationality and is unable or, owing to such fear, is unwilling to avail himself of the protection of that country"

² <https://www.unhcr.org/globaltrends2018/>

across Pak-Afghan border is traditionally taken place under an unregulated and unmonitored system, thus making it close to impossible to give an accurate number of unregistered refugees. As a result, Pakistan has been the most vulnerable country to mass migration, militants’ movement, drugs trafficking and arms smuggling from Afghanistan (Khan 2017).

The socio-economic experiences of refugees directly and indirectly contribute to development in the host country. Displacements may negatively affect labour market outcomes for the refugees, especially if they do not possess the legal right to work. Moreover, it may also result in loss of assets that makes refugees more vulnerable to economic shocks (Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development 2017).

3. Methodology

Quantitative and qualitative methods were used to conduct a baseline study. For the sake of quantitative information, face-to-face interviews of selected community members (primary sampling units) comprising Afghan refugees were conducted by using a structured questionnaire. Following were the elements of baseline survey.

Elements of Baseline Survey			
Sample units	Sampling universe	Sampling selection strategy	Sample size
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Four provinces as well as Islamabad were considered as sampling units 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Afghan refugees living in Pakistan were considered a universe 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Snowball sampling was done for the refugees' selection 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 590 Afghan refugees • 250 host community • 95% level of significance • 0.05 Margin of error • Design effects (Deff)=2

A total of 590 Afghan refugees were interviewed in Quetta, Karachi, Peshawar, Rawalpindi, and Islamabad while 250 respondents from the host community were also interviewed (Annexure-A). The survey was carried out with those households, who lived in the neighborhood of Afghan refugees in order to have more in-depth response regarding the impact of refugees on the host community. Qualitative information was also collected through Focus Group Discussions (FGDs), and Key Informant Interviews (KIIs).

The survey collected the information regarding educational background of respondents and any technical training they attain. Labour market description is composed through professional experience, employment status, and wage information. Further details were asked from businesses regarding their business sector and employees. These details could be helpful in understanding the barriers to formal labour market for refugees and their engagements in informal sector. Social cohesion was examined through settling and integrating refugees with host communities and their social networking.

4. Findings

a. Demographic Overview

Respondents of the survey predominantly fall in two identities namely Pashtun (53%) and Tajik (21%). Respondents from other communities mostly belong to the Uzbek ethnicity. 85% respondents mention Afghanistan as their birthplace, and after migrating to Pakistan, they are settled in Sindh province. Similarly, 59% respondents, who were born in Afghanistan, are settled in KP after migration. Hence, they are first generation Afghans. In Islamabad region, 42 per cent respondents mentioned Pakistan as their birthplace whereas only 36 per cent respondents in Balochistan and 28 per cent in the Punjab were born in Pakistan. Hence, they are classified as second-generation Afghans.

Table 1: Main reason to leave Afghanistan

Reasons to leave Afghanistan	Province					
	Balochistan	ICT	Khyber Pakhtunkhwa	Punjab	Sindh	Total
Conflict/security situation	74%	55%	73%	57%	70%	69%
Poverty	19%	23%	17%	28%	18%	19%
Lack of livelihood opportunities	4%	15%	4%	7%	3%	6%
Lack of basic public services	2%	7%	2%	2%	7%	4%

Source: SDPI Survey (2018)

A majority of respondents (69%) cited conflict and security situation as the main reason for fleeing Afghanistan. Only 19 per cent respondents said that poverty was another main reason for moving to Pakistan (Table 1). 6% of respondents said that there was a lack of livelihood opportunities in Afghanistan, so they had to move to Pakistan in search of livelihood opportunities. The same is also identified by Borthakur (2017).

Table 2: Response of Host community

Response of host community	Province					
	Balochistan	ICT	Khyber Pakhtunkhwa	Punjab	Sindh	Total
Extremely welcoming	18%	39%	29%	59%	23%	27%
Welcoming	66%	52%	63%	41%	62%	61%
Unwelcoming	7%	4%	3%	0%	5%	4%
Don't know	9%	4%	5%	0%	9%	7%

Source: SDPI Survey (2018)

A total of 61 per cent respondents said that the Pakistani community responded warmly to Afghan refugees on their arrival in Pakistan (Table 2). Nearly 60 per cent of the respondents in the Punjab said that the response of host community was extremely welcoming, and they

were received warmly. A majority of Afghan refugees reported that the host community was very receptive and cordially received refugees on their arrival. Majority respondents said they were assisted in securing food, housing and livelihoods. Others said that with the passage of time, the relations between the refugees and host communities grew better and stronger”. It has also been observed that some respondents were born in Pakistan, and they consider Pakistan as their homeland.

Respondents in KP said that they participate in local festivals with the host community and share strong social and family networks. It has been noted that the host community takes care of refugee children when their parents are not at home. Monetary benefits and housing were other major measures through which the host community helped the Afghan refugees. A respondent said that a teacher from the host community helped his son in studies. One of the respondents said that a Pakistani gifted him his shop.

In Balochistan, respondents pointed out that the host community provided them with food and shelter due to which they faced no problem in settling down. One respondent said that the host community provided them with food and shelter for three years. In Rawalpindi, respondents said that they left Afghanistan due to security situation and now they are peacefully residing in Pakistan along with the host community.

Table 3: Social networks of Afghan refugees

Social networks of Afghan refugees	Province					
	Balochistan	ICT	Khyber Pakhtunkhwa	Punjab	Sindh	Total
Strong network of friends in Pakistan	60%	48%	46%	52%	51%	51%
Strong network of Afghan friends in Pakistan	23%	22%	30%	14%	44%	30%
Don't have much interaction with local community	7%	13%	0%	10%	1%	4%
Strong network of family	7%	4%	23%	3%	3%	11%
Any other	3%	12%	0%	21%	1%	4%

Source: SDPI Survey (2018)

60 per cent respondents in Balochistan and 46 per cent in KP said that they had a strong network of friends in Pakistan (Table 3). In total, 30 percent of respondents said they had a strong network of Afghan friends in Pakistan while the highest ratio in this regard was observed in Sindh that was 44 per cent. Only 10 per cent respondents in the Punjab said that they didn't interact much with the local community.

55 per cent respondents in Balochistan said that they participated in community events such as family gatherings in their surroundings. In Sindh, 38 per cent respondents said they took

part in religious services while 14 per cent people in Islamabad participated in recreational activities, such as visits to parks and community centers.

Respondent refugees said family events/gatherings were the major areas of their social networking. 44 per cent respondents in total and 64 per cent in Balochistan termed family events as a major contribution in their lives. This is due to the fact that such events/gatherings helped them in developing family ties and learning social values. 22 per cent of respondents in Sindh said that social networking helped them in getting employment while 15 per cent in the Punjab said that access to healthcare improved due to the social networking.

b. The main challenges encountered by refugees

This section illustrates socio-economic problems encountered by the refugees. The basic premise of illustrating them is to highlight their intensity, which could potentially be dealt with by re-examining the refugee policy.

Table 4: Main challenges identified by refugees

Main challenges	Province					
	Balochistan	ICT	Khyber Pakhtunkhwa	Punjab	Sindh	Total
Access to health	24%	9%	13%	15%	26%	17%
Access to education	18%	18%	16%	20%	20%	18%
Law and order	8%	8%	4%	8%	11%	7%
Employment opportunities	7%	15%	9%	13%	21%	12%
Access to housing	30%	22%	21%	13%	3%	19%
Documentation or personal identification documents	7%	17%	17%	13%	17%	15%
Lack of freedom of movement	6%	9%	16%	13%	1%	9%
Other	0%	2%	4%	6%	0%	2%

Source: SDPI Survey (2018)

Three main challenges identified by the respondents across the country were access to housing, education and healthcare (Table 4). Access to healthcare seems to be a prevalent problem particularly in Sindh and Balochistan. Respondent refugees in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa were mostly concerned about access to housing. Lack of employment opportunities was mostly raised by the refugees in Sindh. 16 per cent of respondents in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa and 13 per cent in the Punjab said that they faced difficulties while moving outside.

Table 5: Feeling safe while moving outside

Feeling safe	Province					
	Balochistan	ICT	Khyber Pakhtunkhwa	Punjab	Sindh	Total
Very	41%	33%	57%	59%	24%	43%
Quite	29%	52%	29%	24%	32%	32%
Rather unsafe	7%	7%	10%	7%	15%	10%
Not at all safe	18%	7%	3%	10%	27%	13%
Don't know	5%	0%	0%	0%	2%	2%

Source: SDPI Survey (2018)

43 per cent of respondents feel very safe whereas 32 per cent quite safe while going to the market or their workplace (Table 5). The relative feeling of safety prevailed in the Punjab, KP and ICT compared to Sindh and Balochistan where 42 per cent and 25 per cent said that they feel rather unsafe or not safe respectively.

Table 6: Obstacles in getting employment

Obstacles in getting employment	Province					
	Balochistan	ICT	Khyber Pakhtunkhwa	Punjab	Sindh	Total
Not having a POR card (other family members)	0%	22%	6%	15%	4%	9%
Permanent disability	5%	3%	3%	4%	3%	3%
Lack of skills	26%	19%	17%	23%	21%	21%
Lack of education/qualification	29%	31%	39%	29%	44%	36%
Lack of employment opportunities in the area of residence	0%	14%	1%	6%	1%	4%
Cultural obstacles for women	5%	3%	8%	2%	8%	6%
Lack of transport	27%	2%	8%	2%	16%	11%
Temporary illness	5%	1%	0%	2%	0%	1%
Other	2%	4%	18%	17%	3%	9%

Source: SDPI Survey (2018)

A total of 57 per cent of refugees said that they found it difficult to get themselves employed. Similarly, 81 per cent of respondents in Sindh reported the same difficulties in this area (Table 6). Lack of education/qualification and skills was described as the major obstacle in getting employment across all provinces. Occupational differences existed between refugees

and host community due to variation in their education and skills (Kibria 1994). Respondents in Balochistan and Sindh also highlighted lack of transportation as a significant obstacle. They also complained about discrimination against refugees.

26 per cent refugees said that lack of education was a major issue in their re-employment whereas 30 per cent respondents in the Punjab also faced the same issue. Lack of education is also a major problem for refugees in Islamabad and KP as 24 per cent and 27 per cent respondents respectively said that lack of education is the hurdle to get themselves re-employed. 29 per cent refugees in Sindh said that they felt difficulty in getting employment due to lack of education. In Balochistan, the major issue pointed out by 28 per cent respondents was lack of work experience.

Table 7: Main obstacle in doing business

Obstacles in doing business	Province					
	Balochistan	ICT	Khyber Pakhtunkhwa	Punjab	Sindh	Total
Taxes/fees	21%	3%	9%	14%	0%	9%
Informal payments	7%	6%	6%	0%	0%	5%
Security (violence/robbery)	14%	13%	6%	14%	57%	10%
Discrimination	0%	19%	5%	0%	29%	7%
Lack of access to credit	36%	3%	35%	21%	0%	27%
Energy prices	0%	6%	5%	0%	0%	4%
Energy availability	0%	0%	6%	0%	0%	4%
Difficulties in registrations	0%	16%	15%	14%	0%	14%
Hiring of labor	7%	0%	2%	0%	0%	2%
Inspection by regulatory bodies	7%	16%	3%	21%	14%	7%
Other	7%	19%	9%	14%	0%	10%

Source: SDPI Survey (2018)

Respondents in Balochistan, KP and the Punjab identified the lack of access to credit as a major obstacle in their efforts to conduct and expand their businesses (Table 7). This was followed by difficulties which they had to face for the registration of their businesses. In contrast, the respondents in Sindh were primarily concerned about security and discrimination. The latter was also highlighted by respondents in the ICT.

c. Refugee perspectives on self-reliance, empowerment, and livelihoods

This section deals with the emic perspective of refugees about pursuing livelihood strategies and repatriation. Lack of skills is identified as the main obstacle in gaining employment at times as Pakistani counterparts are more skilled as compared to Afghan labourers. Business owners also pointed out that Pakistani worker are more skilled compared to Afghan laborers.

This is due to the fact that Afghan workers have not received any vocational training and the same was identified by the respondents.

Most of the Afghan refugees have set up consumer and retail shops so as to earn their livelihood; however, these shops are not registered with the government of Pakistan. Refugees are also running their own businesses and the respondents from businesses include refugees dealing in leather sector, carpet, and jewellery. The results are in line with Maystadt and Verwimp (2014) who argue that small businesses increased after the influx of refugees. Mostly, Afghans are engaged in informal work which has displaced the local workers in the informal sectors, and the same is found by Certoglu et al. (2015) in the case of Turkey where Syrian refugees influx had decreased the informal employment for Turkish workers. Moreover, Pakistani workers have also been employed by the businesses of Afghan respondents. The exchange of labour and assets helped in promoting social and economic interdependence between Afghan refugees and host communities (Feinstein International Famine Center 2002).

Afghan refugees, who are running their own businesses, complained that they cannot obtain bank loans, which is a major constraint in the way of expanding their business. They demand access to credit in the same way, as their Pakistani counterparts do. The Afghan refugees operating business in Pakistan face problems in transferring money through banking channels which is similar to transferring remittances in Pakistan for which they have to rely on informal channels or depend on Pakistani people for making transactions. Those who depend on employment often face difficulties in getting employment. This is partly due to discrimination against a refugee and also on the pretext of work experience and lack of education. Refugees spend major chunk of their earnings on rent. Food is yet another area on which a big part of their income is spent, which is in line with the results of a study by Danish Refugee Council (2013). Respondents said that they use savings and at times get loan from family and friends to meet expenses.

d. Perspectives of Refugees on co-existence in host communities

i. Unpleasant experiences of refugees

There was a concern amongst respondents, who mentioned that police harassment is often faced by them. Two respondents narrated that their male family members were detained by the police who were released after taking bribe. Incidents of derogatory behaviour were reported by the respondents in KP where the host community bullied refugees to go back to Afghanistan. Such incidents mostly happen when law and order situation and relations between Afghanistan and Pakistan are strained. A respondent narrated that his son who was a college teacher, left teaching and returned to Afghanistan due to inhospitable behavior of the local community. Some respondents also narrated that they do not allow their children to leave home during any clash between children of refugees and local community.

Refugees complained that they face difficulties in health care, especially when they have to wait for long in hospitals merely because of their refugee status. More importantly, women who need special attention at the time of delivery are not treated immediately because of being refugees.

In Balochistan, respondents said that the host community would occasionally ask them about their return to Afghanistan. Some respondents complained that they face problems when they want to rent a house. One of the respondents said that his landlord has increased the rent, which has made it difficult for him to manage the expenses.

e. Perception of Host Community

This section deals with perceptions of host community about the co-existence of refugees.

The host community was of the opinion that generally, the process of social cohesion after the influx of refugees was peaceful and no unpleasant incident ever occurred. The host community warmly welcomed refugees and helped them in settling down. However, with the passage of time and after a continuous influx of refugees, housing facilities within a particular area depleted. New construction was required to accommodate more refugees. One of the respondents said that a portion was rented out to a refugee family who later damaged the living area.

The host community said they had good relations with refugees and also have Afghan friends. Community members participate in social and cultural events and they jointly celebrate religious festivals. Both communities help each other in the hour of need such as in health-related needs. Some respondents said that families, who have repatriated to Afghanistan, are still in contact with local community.

The host community reported that the number of small and medium enterprises have increased considerably with the influx of refugees. One of the respondents proudly said that he was given a job by a refugee businessman. Similarly, another respondent said that a refugee gave him loan when he was in dire need of money. New business opportunities have been created, as the refugees, who are running their own businesses, also created opportunities for the host community.

Respondents complained that some refugees are involved in social evils and the former had received verbal threats from the latter. Occasionally, women from the host community are harassed by the refugees when they leave home. In Quetta and Peshawar, respondents also complained of the alleged involvement of refugees in illegal activities, such as kidnapping for ransom and drug-trafficking.

The local community demanded of the government to either grant refugees citizenship or make arrangements for their repatriation. The host community is of the view that the government should provide legal status to refugees so that they can expand their business which will ultimately be beneficial for the countrymen, including the local people.

Table 8: Experience of Settling and Social Cohesion with Refugees

Social cohesion with refugees	Province					
	Balochistan	ICT	Khyber Pakhtunkhwa	Punjab	Sindh	Total
Peaceful	26%	33%	60%	40%	18%	35%
Difficult but manageable	14%	32%	28%	32%	15%	25%
Challenging	48%	28%	8%	21%	31%	27%
Don't know	12%	4%	2%	2%	35%	10%
Any other experience	0%	3%	2%	6%	2%	2%

Source: SDPI Survey (2018)

A process of social cohesion was positively perceived in KP, and to some extent in the Punjab (Table 8). The host community benefited from the SMEs established by refugees, who boosted the economic activities. Both local and Afghan communities have linkages and participate in each other's social events and religious festivals.

Table 9: Changes after the influx of refugees

Changes after the influx of refugees	Province					
	Balochistan	ICT	Khyber Pakhtunkhwa	Punjab	Sindh	Total
New construction	6%	22%	18%	16%	11%	15%
Host adjust newcomers in their own houses	24%	20%	27%	24%	17%	23%
Lack of jobs	16%	10%	8%	7%	22%	13%
Lack of basic public utilities	15%	19%	19%	9%	18%	16%
Lack of education facilities	15%	6%	6%	7%	18%	11%
Lack of health facilities	12%	5%	12%	6%	6%	8%
Unrest in locality	2%	12%	4%	12%	5%	7%
Increase in skilled workforce	10%	4%	5%	6%	3%	6%
Any other	0%	3%	2%	11%	0%	3%

Source: SDPI Survey (2018)

In total, 15 per cent respondents said that new buildings had to be constructed in their locality to accommodate the refugees (Table 9). Islamabad is in the lead where 22 per cent respondents said that new buildings had to be constructed. 18 per cent respondents in KP also demanded construction of new houses after the influx of refugees. 27 per cent in KP and 24

per cent in Balochistan said that they accommodated the newcomers in their own houses. In total, 16 per cent respondents complained of lack of basic utilities after the arrival of refugees in the locality. Markets are now crowded with refugees, causing price hike and shortage of food items. Yield (2006) also stated that this occurs due to strain on resources, which may affect the relation between refugees and host community. Alix and Saah (2009) mentioned that the price hike is more visible in the areas which are in the proximity of refugee camps.

Table 10: Access to Facilities

Facility	Description	Province					
		Balochistan	ICT	Khyber Pakhtunkhwa	Punjab	Sindh	Total
Education	Improve	4%	2%	10%	0%	17%	7%
Health		2%	0%	0%	0%	6%	2%
Water		2%	5%	2%	4%	13%	5%
Education	Declined	62%	18%	30%	12%	24%	29%
Health		68%	16%	58%	14%	41%	39%
Water		76%	34%	36%	52%	39%	47%
Education	Remained same	30%	71%	52%	80%	24%	52%
Health		14%	77%	34%	80%	19%	45%
Water		20%	55%	62%	40%	37%	43%
Education	Don't know	4%	9%	8%	8%	35%	13%
Health		16%	7%	8%	6%	35%	15%
Water		2%	5%	0%	4%	11%	5%

Source: SDPI Survey (2018)

Access to education improved in Sindh where 17 per cent respondents said the improvement came after the arrival of refugees (Table 10). In Islamabad, only 02 per cent respondents saw an improvement in access to education. On the contrary, 62 per cent respondents in Balochistan said that access to education had actually declined. 68 per cent complained about the difficulties in securing access to health facilities whereas only 02 per cent respondents affirmed improvement in access to health services.

Overall, 47 per cent respondents complained of decrease in availability of clean drinking water after the arrival of refugees in their locality. The worst situation was observed in Balochistan, where 76 per cent respondents complained about lack of access to clean water. In the Punjab, 52 per cent respondents pointed out that the availability of clean drinking water declined. On the other hand, 62 per cent host community in KP narrated no change in securing access to clean drinking water.

i. Unpleasant Experiences

The host community in Islamabad said they had minor differences with the neighbouring refugees and no major incident ever occurred. However, one respondent said that he had an

Afghan refugee partner in business, who deceived him, so he had to bear loss in business. One respondent pointed out that once his mobile was snatched by a person who seemed to be a refugee. Verbal clashes were also reported by some of the respondents. It is learnt that refugees are using illegal electricity connections which puts pressure on the local community in terms of additional payment of utility bills. Crisp (2000) and Jacobsen (2000) also pointed out in their studies that refugees are found to be involved in illegal activities which created problems for host communities.

Many respondents in Balochistan said that they did not experience an unpleasant incident and claimed that refugees are peaceful people. However, there were respondents, who had faced the bad behaviour of refugees. One respondent said he faced routine quarrels with neighboring refugees. One respondent said that quarrels among children often lead to bigger clashes. Verbal threats from refugees were also reported by the respondents whereas complaints regarding refugees' assault on the local community were also witnessed. Reportedly, a person who seemed to be a refugee, snatched the motorbike of a local at gunpoint.

The host community in Peshawar pointed out that they had no bad experience in this connection. However, incidents like quarrels with refugees were reported by the host community. A few respondents narrated that they had granted loan to refugees, who had defaulted. Some respondents expressed their annoyance over renting-out a portion of their house to a refugee family.

More than 50 per cent respondents in the Punjab said that they had not bear ill will from the refugees. The host community in Sindh province experienced several bad incidents at the hands of Afghan refugees. A number of respondents said refugees are involved in illegal activities such as street crimes, which affect the host community. Refugees are also involved in physical violence carried out in host community whereas misbehaviour from refugees was also reported. The host community was of the view that street crimes have increased mainly because of refugees.

20 per cent respondents out of the total believed that refugees are involved in criminal activities, including theft. The most critical situation was observed in the Punjab where 28 per cent respondents believed that refugees were involved in criminal activities, such as theft. Drug-trafficking seems to be a major evil in Balochistan where refugees' involvement was pointed out. In KP, 19 per cent respondents said they faced verbal threats from refugees. However, some respondents said that refugees were not involved in any social evil and they do not face or observe any misbehaviour from refugees. According to the host community, the economy of Pakistan has also been negatively affected because of the drastic security situation after the influx of Afghan refugees.

ii. Pleasant Experiences

Although the host community has limited interaction with Afghan refugees in Islamabad, some occasionally attend family events, such as marriage ceremonies. Respondents in Balochistan said they attend wedding ceremonies of the Afghan community and also interact

with them regularly. It was informed that children of both the communities play with each other and have close interaction.

In KP, social interaction between the host and refugee communities is strong. They enjoy a good relationship. Respondents from KP believe that Pakistan has taken great care of refugees in the past few decades, which has created a positive image of Pakistan in the world. Respondents said they have Afghan business partners, who helped them grow their business and also provided loan when required. The host community said that refugees were hardworking people and their business helped locals in opening up of more job opportunities. One respondent said that once a refugee helped him in emergency and took him to the hospital. One of the respondents was thankful to a refugee family for helping them sell clothes stitched by her daughter.

Table 11: Labor contribution of refugees

Labor contribution of refugees	Province					
	Balochistan	ICT	Khyber Pakhtunkhwa	Punjab	Sindh	Total
Supply of skilled labour increased	22%	11%	11%	25%	21%	17%
Supply of unskilled labour increased	41%	37%	36%	31%	50%	39%
Increase in SMEs run by refugees	19%	25%	26%	23%	19%	23%
Excess supply of labour decreases wage rate	19%	28%	27%	22%	10%	21%
Other	0%	0%	0%	0%	0%	0%

Source: SDPI Survey (2018)

The demand for unskilled labour increased by 39 per cent after the arrival of refugees (Table 11). 50 per cent respondents from the host community in Sindh and 31 per cent in the Punjab said that the number of unskilled workers had increased. The same results were given by Danish Refugee Council (2013). This is also due to the availability of cheap manpower in the form of refugees that has increased their demand (Bond 2002). 17% said that supply of skilled labour increased after the influx of Afghan refugees and the same is also mentioned by Guudel (2003) in his study. On the other hand, 23 per cent respondents affirmed that refugees promoted SMEs while 26 per cent in KP indicated that SMEs run by refugees have increased in their region.

Table 12: Employment prospects for the local community

Employment prospects for local community	Province					
	Balochistan	ICT	Khyber Pakhtunkhwa	Punjab	Sindh	Total
Increase in jobs	2%	4%	16%	6%	6%	7%
Decrease in jobs	67%	34%	64%	36%	41%	48%
Remained same	16%	38%	8%	40%	11%	23%
Don't know	14%	25%	12%	18%	43%	23%

Source: SDPI Survey (2018)

48 per cent respondents pointed out that the number of available jobs decreased with the influx of refugees and they face difficulty in getting employment, as now more workers are competing for limited number of jobs (Table 12). In Balochistan, 67 per cent respondents complained about lack of jobs whereas only 02 per cent said that jobs had actually increased. 16 per cent respondents in KP said that the number of jobs had increased after the arrival of refugees.

Table 13: Price level of basic facilities & food

Price level		Province					
		Balochistan	ICT	Khyber Pakhtunkhwa	Punjab	Sindh	Total
Basic facilities	Increase	45%	36%	72%	14%	33%	40%
Food		49%	29%	72%	22%	30%	40%
Basic facilities	Declined	33%	5%	10%	14%	19%	16%
Food		24%	4%	4%	4%	13%	10%
Basic facilities	Remained same	18%	54%	18%	58%	28%	36%
Food		22%	61%	22%	70%	30%	41%
Basic facilities	Don't know	4%	5%	0%	14%	20%	9%
Food		4%	7%	2%	4%	26%	9%

Source: SDPI Survey (2018)

40 per cent respondents from host community said that the prices of basic facilities increased after the arrival of refugees (Table 13). In KP, 72 per cent respondents from host community pointed out increase in prices. However, 33 per cent respondents in Balochistan said that prices declined while 36 per cent in total said that no change occurred in the prices of basic facilities due to Afghan refugees. 41 per cent respondents said that prices of food items had not changed because of the Afghan refugees while 70 per cent respondents in the Punjab

claimed no change in prices of food items. In Balochistan, 24 per cent respondents were of the view that prices of food items actually declined while 61 per cent in Islamabad said prices remained the same.

5. Conclusion

Afghan refugees have been residing in Pakistan for almost four decades now. Many are born here. Refugees are facing challenges in accessing socio-economic facilities for which they demand of Pakistan government to take deliberate steps for the solution of their problems. While living in Pakistan, refugees are making economic contribution through labour and businesses. The refugees also want to return to Afghanistan but not until the security situation becomes stable in Afghanistan (Ghufran 2011). Monetary assistance should be provided to those, who intend to return to Afghanistan so that they may settle comfortably. Better relations of both Afghanistan and Pakistan can resolve the refugees' matter which will be beneficial not only for both countries but most importantly, for the refugees.

Analytically, literature on humanitarian governance and state building could be explored to devise strategies to deal with refugees' resettlement in Afghanistan. An approach to governance is proposed to inquire how 'refugees' struggle to acquire humanitarian aid or social services. In the provision of aid broadly and local services more specifically, humanitarian agencies, Non-Governmental Organizations, local actors, and governments typically operate in an increasingly complex milieu, i.e. ignoring the localized dimensions of "access problems". What this essentially means is that not many studies have captured the complex ways in which basic relief services and legal aid is provided. Future research will preciously be responding to this often-neglected area which is, how the host country is responding to "refugees" education, health care and humanitarian needs. Particular importance may be focused on the essential role of how local state organizations and NGOs deliver social assistance, etc. in a particular locale, community or in a "refugee camp". A potential contribution of examining humanitarian governance would be to know how governability can be improved so as to ensure effective humanitarian services.

6. Policy Recommendations

The foremost demand of the Afghan refugees from the government of Pakistan is to provide them citizenship so that they can have access to basic facilities. Afghan respondents claim that they are living in Pakistan for decades and consider the host country their homeland. In that respect, a national identity like computerized ID card number will allow them to purchase property which, in turn, could also solve their housing problems. Other respondents said that the government should provide them housing facilities. Access to basic facilities, including health and education, was also demanded by the refugees. Similarly, refugees demanded that free medical treatment should be provided to the poor ones.

Several possibilities require government attention. For example, the prime minister has already announced that Afghan refugees living in Pakistan for over four decades will be

provided national ID cards and passports. Second, he also announced that Afghan refugees will now be able to open bank accounts. The implementation of these directives needs to be expedited. The State Bank of Pakistan's rules for SME financing will also require amendment. Likewise, amendments to Company Act of Securities and Exchange Commission of Pakistan would be required.

A more expedient visa service is required for those refugees involved in bilateral trade between the two countries. Currently, the visa regime at Pakistan's embassy and consulates inside Afghanistan is cumbersome and involves substantial transaction costs to Afghan businesspersons and kin of those with refugee status in Pakistan. Perhaps automating the existing procedures and online processing of visa applications can be a decent way forward.

Afghan respondents also said that they want the government of Pakistan to provide them employment so that they can have reasonable earnings. Some Afghan businessmen said they have property in Afghanistan, and if Pakistan government accepts them as citizens, they will sell their assets and bring more investments here. This will ensure their safety and make them free of any undue fear from the police and the local community. Afghan refugees also want the government to ease the barriers in movement to and from Afghanistan so that they can easily visit their family members in Afghanistan. The respondents said that the government should devise a plan to provide micro finance to refugees so that they can also establish their own small businesses.

A related demand is to consider the provision of self-employment incentives for Afghan refugees and the youth born in Pakistan. The latter should be allowed to benefit from the benefits available to micro start-up enterprises in Pakistan. Refugee youths could also be encouraged through financial support to initiate social enterprises, which can benefit their communities in a sustainable manner. The development partners having knowledge in support of social enterprises can also back this endeavour (Knack 2000).

Currently, while Afghan refugees contribute to Pakistan's national income and do contribute to taxes in the form of indirect taxes, they cannot benefit from existing formal social safety nets. While Islamabad's claim is that these matters and welfare of marginalized is the responsibility of the provincial government, the latter however regard refugees as a monetary burden and claim that the responsibility of their wellbeing lies with the federal government. It is now extremely important that an intergovernmental working group should meet on quarterly basis to set an agenda and work towards ensuring the welfare of those, who are living inside the boundaries of Pakistan after completion of all legal requirements.

In a refugee crisis, women and children are particularly the most affected. Examining current options for refugees through a gender lens has become imperative. The women population can be enabled to become productive players in the society through wage-employment, self-employment, and even voluntary work.

The government may ensure that no child goes without basic facilities, which include education, health, and nutrition. In this respect, the government can formally approach World Health Organisation, World Food Programme and UNICEF to put in place a medium-term programme for these children to protect their rights in all respects.

Dealing with incidents of misbehaviour (in case of refugee population) requires putting in place appropriate strategies by the law-enforcement authorities and civil administration. These may involve, capacity development agencies, which interact with the refugee population frequently. Such capacity building initiatives should focus on inculcating interactional skills in state institutions for dealing with refugees.

To ensure provision of livelihood opportunities to refugees, the government can incentivize the local business community to hire refugee labor force. Such hiring will also ensure that formal social protection is also provided to these workers. The corporate social responsibility initiatives by businesses and private sector foundations can also play an important role.

The Afghan refugees, who intend to return to Afghanistan, said that they want livelihood opportunities and housing facilities in their own country. The government of Afghanistan should provide them with loans so that they might start their own businesses. Others said that basic facilities, including health and education, are required to ensure better future prospects for their children in Afghanistan. This is an area where development partners can help either the government in Afghanistan or directly help the private sector development in the main cities such as Kabul.

The concern related to housing also remains a key issue for the refugees living in Pakistan. It is, therefore, recommended that Afghan refugees should also be considered as potential beneficiary of the currently under formulation scheme of low-cost housing development at the Prime Minister's Office. The low-cost houses developed in Balochistan and Khyber Pakhtunkhwa could provide a minority quota to the refugees.

Likewise, the recently implemented Prime Minister's Health Programme should also allow access to refugees as they already lack formal social protection. A failure to do so will prevent Pakistan from achieving universal health targets. Targeting the refugees for this purpose could be improved through Benazir Income Support Programme (BISP) poverty score card exercise, which is regularly updated.

The treatment and overall handling of refugees inside the country and at the border posts requires attention. The Pakistani staff on the borders and inside the country that deals with issues of refugees on a daily basis should be provided extensive training support. They should be oriented with the rights of refugee population and how to treat them properly as per the United Nation conventions. This will also significantly improve Pakistan's outlook for the purpose of international evaluations, e.g. the review of GSP+ scheme by European Union expected in 2020 will take into account Pakistan's compliance with 27 human rights, labour and environmental conventions.

In fragile states such as Afghanistan, international development partners can provide a framework for effectively dealing with conflict situations and security concerns. The foremost organization, which actively promotes dialogues around issues dealing with conflict insensitivities is (United Nations Global Compact (Haufler 2007). The other objective of international partners' engagement in Afghanistan is to re-build state society relations through social welfare program. Moreover, rebuilding of state institutions and civil service reforms are often neglected by the international community in post-conflict states (Blair

2007). In the context of unreliable social services in Afghanistan, building capable state institutions for delivering public goods 'efficiently, predictably and in the right quantity' to citizens should become the foremost agenda of donors in Afghanistan (Goldsmith 2007).

Generally, refugees have no expectations from the Afghanistan government as they are mostly not willing to go back. This is due to the fact that many respondents were born in Pakistan and consider it their homeland. Others said that they are living in Pakistan for the past many years and are now settled. Refugees claimed that they feel safe in Pakistan and their women are safer here as compared to Afghanistan. However, a few respondents said that the Afghan government should ensure peace and stability so that they may decide to return. The refugees mentioned lack of livelihood opportunities, access to education and health facilities in Afghanistan. Others said the Afghan government should collaborate and cooperate with the Pakistani government to promote peaceful relations. This will also help them settle in Pakistan.

A large part of the refugee population was associated with Afghanistan-Pakistan transit trade (Authors 2015). Unfortunately, the recent weak dialogue on this subject and falling transit levels have resulted in layoffs. Perhaps an early resumption of dialogue which overtime paves the way for measures that enhance bilateral and transit trade between the two countries can put several households back to work (Authors 2016). The government of Pakistan had forwarded the revisions to Afghanistan-Pakistan Transit Trade Agreement (APTTA) to Kabul in 2017. However, even after the passage of more than a year, the government of Afghanistan has not yet responded.

References

- Ahmed, V and S, Shabbir 2016, Trade & Transit Cooperation with Afghanistan: Results from a Firm-level survey from Pakistan, Working Paper # 153, Sustainable Development Policy Institute
- Ahmed, V 2017, Pakistan's Agenda for Economic Reforms, Oxford University Press, Karachi
- Alix-Garcia, J and Saah, D 2010, "The Effect of Refugee Inflows on host Communities: Evidence from Tanzania", 01 January, *The World Bank Economic Review*, vol. 24, no. 1
- Afghan Research and Evaluation Unit 2006, Afghans in Peshawar: Migration, Settlements and Networks, AREU Case Studies Series.
- Blair, H 2007, Rebuilding and reforming civil services in post-conflict societies. In *Governance in Post-Conflict Societies: Rebuilding fragile states*. Edited by Derick W. Brinkerhoff. Published by Routledge. UK
- Bond, B 2002, Can Humanitarian Work with Refugees be Humane?. *Human Rights Quarterly*, vol. 24
- Borthakur, A 2017, Afghan refugees: The impact on Pakistan. *Asian Affairs*, vol. 48, no.3, pp. 488-509
- Ceritoglu, E, Yunculer, HBG, Torun, H and Tumen, S 2015, "The Impact of Syrian Refugees on Natives' Labor Market Outcomes in Turkey: Evidence from a Quasi Experimental Design", September, IZA Discussion Papers # 9348, Institute for the Study of Labor (IZA).
- Christensen, H 1989, Refugee Participation Network, Refugee Studies Programme, Queen Elizabeth House, 21 St Giles, OXFORD OX1 3LA, UK. Pp. 1-4
- Commission, E 2016, The Syrian Refugee Crisis: Labour Market Implications in Jordan and Lebanon". 29 May, Discussion Paper.
- Crisp, J (200, Forms and sources of violence in Kenya's refugee camps", *Refugee Studies Quarterly*, vol. 19, no. 1, pp. 54-70.
- Danish Refugee Council 2013, Socio-Economic Survey of Afghan Refugees Living in Pakistan, DRC
- European Commission 2016, The Syrian Refugee Crisis: Labour Market Implications in Jordan and Lebanon", Discussion Papers, 29 May, Brussels
- Feinstein International Famine Center 2002, Nutrition and livelihoods in situations of crisis and conflict; reducing vulnerability and risk", concept paper for the ACC/SCN 29 session, Symposium on Nutrition in the Context of Crisis and Conflict, hosted by the German Government, Berlin, 11-15 March, FIFC
- Ghufuran, Nasreen 2011, The Role of UNHCR and Afghan Refugees in Pakistan" In: Strategic Analysis, Office of the United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees. vol. 35, no. 6, pp. 946-951
- Goldsmith, AA 2007, Does nation building work? Reviewing the record in Governance in Post-Conflict Societies: Rebuilding fragile states, Edited by Derick W. Brinkerhoff (2007), Routledge, UK.

- Guudel, NB 2003), The Role of Food Aid in Drought and Recovery: Oxfam and North Turkana (Kenya) Drought Relief Programme, 1992 /1994, Nairobi Oxfarm.
- Haqqani, H 2005, Between Mosque and Military: Carnage Endowment for international peace publication, Washington DC.
- Haufler, V 2007, The private sector and governance in post-conflict societies. In Governance in Post-Conflict Societies: Rebuilding fragile states, Edited by Derick W. Brinkerhoff (2007). Routledge. UK
- Intitute of Policy Studies 2018, Afghan Refugees in Pakistan: A Policy Dialogue, . IPS
- Mosel, I and Jackson, A 2013, Sanctuary in the city? Urban displacement and vulnerability in Peshawar, Pakistan HPG Working Paper, May, ODI
- Jacobson, K 2000, A framework for exploring the political and security context of refugee populated areas”, *Refugee Studies Quarterly*, 19.
- Pathak, E and Sharmiladevi, JC2018, Refugee Crises around the World Today, *Annual Research Journal of SCMS*, Pune, March, vol. 6,
- Kathon GR 2000, Research Methodology; Methods and Techniques 3rd Ed New York, Oxford Press.
- Khan, A 2017, Afghan Refugees in Pakistan, Institute of Strategic Studies
- Kibria, N 1994, Household Structure and Family Ideologies: The Dynamics of Immigrant Economic Adaptation among Vietnamese Refugees’, *Social Problems*, vol. 41, pp. 81–96.
- Knack, T 2000, The Local Integration and Settlement for Refugees: A Conceptual and Historical Analysis, New Issue in Refugee Research, Geneva, JJNIICR.
- Kucher, G, Ameena 2005, The Effects of Repatriation on Education in Afghan Refugee Camps in Pakistan, Education in Emergencies and Post-Conflict Situations: Problems, Response, and Possibilities. Columbia University, vol. 2, pp. 6
- Maley, F 2011, The Afghan Refugees in Pakistan, Middle East Institute and Fondation Recherche Strategique
- Maystadt, JF and Verwimp, P 2014, “Winners and Losers among a Refugee-Hosting Population”, *Economic Development and Cultural Change*, vol. 62, no. 4, pp. 769-809.
- Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development 2017, Assessing the contribution of refugees to the development of their host countries, OECD Development Centre’s Policy Dialogue on Migration and Development.
- Orodho, YA 2004, Elements of Education and Social Sciences, *Research Methods*, Gaborone, Botswana, Mozilla Publication.
- Simpson, J 1939, The Refugees Problems: Report of a Survey, Oxford University Press.
- Sadat, HM 2008, “Hyphenating Afghaniyat” (Afghan-ness) in the Afghan Diaspora; In: *Journal of Muslim Minority Affairs*, Institute of Muslim Minority Affairs. pp: 330-331.
- Shabbir, S and Ahmed, V 2015, Welfare Impact of Afghan Trade on the Pakistani Provinces of Balochistan and Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Stability: *International Journal of Security & Development*, vol. 4, no. 1): 6, pp. 1-16,
- United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees 1967, Convention and Protocol Relating to the Status of Refugees, UNHCR

- United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees 2012c, Global Appeal 2013 Update - Pakistan, 1 December 2012, UNHCR.
- United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees, 2018, Data Portal, Retrieved from Operational Portal Refugee's Situation: <https://data2.unhcr.org/en/country/pak>
- Victoria M, Esses, LK 2017, The Global Refugee Crisis: Empirical Evidence and Policy Implications for Improving Public Attitude and Facilitating Refugees Settlement, *Social Issues and Policy Review*
- Yield, AM 2006, Community Service in Refugee Aid Programs: A Critical Analysis, UNHCR New Issues in Refugee Research, Working Paper R2.

Annexure-A

Below tables presents the segregation of sample size with respect to the provinces

a.1: Sampling distribution of Afghan refugees

Province Name	District Name	Male	Female	Sample	Percent
Balochistan	Quetta	75	75	150	25%
Sindh	Karachi	50	50	100	17%
Islamabad	Islamabad	30	30	60	10%
Punjab	Rawalpindi	15	15	30	5%
KP	Peshawar	125	125	250	42%
Total		295	295	590	100%

a.2: Sampling distribution of host community ³

Province Name	District Name	Male	Female	Sample
Balochistan	Quetta	25	25	50
Sindh	Karachi	25	25	50
Islamabad	Islamabad	25	25	50
Punjab	Rawalpindi	25	25	50
KP	Peshawar	25	25	50
Total		125	125	250

³ Defined as local citizens residing in Pakistan.