

PROGRAM DESIGN FOR POLICY,
INSTITUTIONAL AND REGULATORY REFORM IN THE
CITY OF LAHORE

LAHORE VISION 2035

Compiled by
ABEEHA ISLAM



FORMAN CHRISTIAN COLLEGE
(A CHARTERED UNIVERSITY)



CENTRE FOR PUBLIC POLICY
AND GOVERNANCE

Together we will create a **ROSHAN PAKISTAN**

LAHORE VISION 2035

Compiled by

ABEEHA ISLAM

Centre for Public Policy and Governance
Forman Christian College (A Chartered University)
Lahore

© 2015 Centre for Public Policy and Governance

This publication or any part of it may be used freely for non-profit purposes provided the source is clearly acknowledged. The publication may not be used for commercial purposes.

Published by: Centre for Public Policy and Governance
Forman Christian College (A Chartered University)
Ferozpur Road, Lahore.

Printed in Lahore by: Newline
0301-8407020 | newline1849@gmail.com
Designed by: Maryam Aamir

CONTENTS

<i>Preface</i>	<i>v</i>
<i>Acknowledgements</i>	<i>vii</i>
<i>List of Acronyms</i>	<i>ix</i>
<i>Executive Summary</i>	<i>xi</i>
<i>Vision</i>	<i>xiii</i>
Chapter 1	
Overview.....	1
Chapter 2	
Design and Goals to Accomplish the Vision.....	2
Chapter 3	
Strategy to Pursue Lahore Vision 2035.....	9
Chapter 4	
A Look at the Development Planning in Lahore.....	11
Chapter 5	
Components of Lahore Vision 2035.....	15
Endnotes.....	24

PREFACE

The Centre for Public Policy and Governance (CPPG), Forman Christian College (A Chartered University) Lahore started Program Design for Policy, Institutional, and Regulatory Reform in the City of Lahore in collaboration with the United States Agency for International Development (USAID) FIRMS Project in November 2012. The purpose of the project was to prepare Lahore Vision 2035 to support the preparation of Integrated Strategic Development Program for Lahore Region 2035 (IDSP-35), by the Lahore Development Authority (LDA). The drafting of Lahore Vision 2035 was considered necessary because it was felt and conveyed by several experts and institutions that Lahore was not utilizing its full potential for achieving economic growth due to inadequate policy choices and institutional arrangements.

To ensure that Lahore Vision 2035 is designed by practitioners, professionals, architects, engineers, urban developers and grassroots community activists, we created a 15 member Core Working Group (CWG). The CWG members included: Dr. Saeed Shafqat, Professor & Founding Director, CPPG, (Convener), Mr. Suleman Ghani (USAID, FIRMS project), Dr Nasir Javed (CEO, Urban Unit), Mr. Mazhar Iqbal (Transport Planner), Mr. Abdul Qadeer Khan (WASA, Lahore), Mr. Shakeel Kashmiri (WASA, Lahore), Mr. Pervaiz Qureshi (Unicon Consulting), Mr. Nazir Ahmad Wattoo (President, Anjuman-i-Samaji Behbood, Faisalabad), Mr. Muhammad Arshad Chaudhary (Eden Developers), Mr. Ghafar Shehzad (Auqaf Department), Mr. Amir Butt (Punjab Urban Resource Centre), Ms. Rabia Nadir (Lahore School of Economics), Mr. Sohail Malik (Lahore Waste Management Company), Mr. Mian Wamiq Anwar (Real Estate Developer), Mr. Raheem ul Haque (CPPG), Mr. Waseem Ashraf (USAID), and Mr. Azeem Niazi (USAID). All of the CWG members played a pivotal role in mentoring and providing guidance to our team of researchers. While we remain indebted to each member of the CWG for their advice and guidance for specific position papers, we are particularly grateful to Mr. Suleman Ghani for his clarity of purpose, dedication and invaluable assistance and advice throughout this project.

When the project was started, we decided to concentrate on five sectors in need of urgent institutional and societal action. These sectors included: (i) Governance and Management; (ii) Transport; (iii) Water, Sewerage, and Solid Waste; (iv) Real Estate Markets; and, (v) Trade. We formed five subcommittees of the members of the CWG to mentor the consultants/researchers writing on each sector. The consultants/experts conducted researches and drafted their reports in consultation with their mentors. Mr. Pervaiz Qureshi led the CWG subcommittee on Real Estate while Mr. Mazhar Iqbal led the CWG subcommittee on Transport Planning. Mr. Suleman Ghani and Dr. Saeed Shafqat mentored all of the consultants/researchers.

This document is the compilation of the themes of five position papers. In fact, the team of each position paper prepared vision for their respective sector. Since the central aim of the project was to prepare Lahore Vision 2035, there was a need to consolidate and synthesize the themes, findings and vision statements of five position papers. The teams of consultants/researchers have contributed collectively to this process. The task of compilation was, however, assigned to Research Associate, Ms Abeeha Islam. She has very skillfully and intelligently woven the themes of the five position papers in this document.

This document is important in many ways. It provides insights into the successes and failures of various initiatives in governance, management and planning of Lahore. It also suggests a way forward for the policymakers tasked with making Lahore a place which it deserves to become given its splendid history and contemporary role in social, economic and cultural development of Pakistan. We have tried to highlight the voices of the hundreds of people we interviewed and consulted during the course of research. In a way this document reflects the vision of people of Lahore. We have also tried to reflect the ways through which the aspirations of the people can be

made a reality living within our resources and capacities. The proposals designed for institutional designing, devolution, spatial and financial planning and peoples' participation are some of the ways, which can help Government of the Punjab and Metropolitan Corporation Lahore, realize the Lahore Vision 2035.

It is important to mention that the task of drafting the position papers and Lahore Vision 2035 was a challenge but we tried to convert it into an opportunity. Bringing various stakeholders together to deliberate on issues is laborious. As we progressed in our work, we could secure the cooperation of government officers, leaders of trade associations, independent experts, students, and citizens. Without continuous feedback from all of them it was difficult to develop position papers and Lahore Vision 2035.

It is also important to acknowledge the role of Dr. Saeed Shafqat, Director CPPG, and Convener, Lahore Vision 2035 in accomplishing the goals of Lahore Vision 2035 project. Without his continuous guidance, support and advice, the accomplishment of the goals of this project was impossible. Despite his busy schedule, he was always available for the research team, CWG members and all stakeholders we worked with.

We seriously hope that Government of the Punjab will take up the Lahore Vision 2035 as a source of support for its activities.

Imdad Hussain, PhD
Lead Researcher
Lahore Vision 2035

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I am highly thankful to Dr. Saeed Shafqat. He was always available for discussions on how to compile the synthesis of the five position papers. I learned a great deal from him. Mr. Suleman Ghani's guidance and support has also been crucial as he would always stress focusing on the goal of Lahore Vision 2035 project. I am also thankful to the members of Core Working Group whose suggestions were always thought-provoking for me and for the writers of position papers. I also acknowledge the support of my colleagues during the compilation of this paper.

Abecha Islam

LIST OF ACRONYMS

CDGL	City District Government Lahore
IMPL	Integrated Master Plan Lahore
LDA	Lahore Development Authority
LIT	Lahore Improvement Trust
LTC	Lahore Transport Company
MAO	Municipal Administration Ordinance
MCL	Metropolitan Corporation Lahore
PCGIP	Punjab Cities Governance Improvement Project
PLGO	Punjab Local Government Ordinance
TMA	Town Municipal Administration
UC	Union Council
WASA	Water and Sanitation Agency

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

This paper is a compilation of the themes of position papers on: (i) Governance and Management; (ii) Transport; (iii) Water, Sewerage, and Solid Waste; (iv) Real Estate Markets; and, (v) Trade. A team of consultants/researchers drafted these position papers in consultation with the Core Working Group. All consultants/researchers conducted documentary and field researches to finalize papers assigned to them. The process of compilation was actually started while the five position papers were being drafted by the consultants/researchers. All of the researchers would meet twice a month to share their findings with each other. In these discussions, themes common to all of the five position papers would be identified and discussed. The purposes of these meetings were: (i) to develop a consolidated vision for the development of Lahore; and, (ii) to design a strategy for achieving the vision for Lahore's development.

The current state of problems in Lahore stems from a number of governance related problems. The agencies and departments do not collect necessary statistics; they do not coordinate well; they do not undertake long-term and well-thought urban planning; and, they do not respond to the needs of the people while conducting their day-to-day business. These problems were thought to stem from an absence of elected and autonomous local governments and centralization of decision-making powers at the provincial level. In simple terms, the absence of political decision-making at the level of Lahore was identified as one of the main causes of the problems of Lahore.

The broader vision for Lahore (aka Lahore Vision 2035), considering the problems of the city, focuses on making Lahore a place where government, politicians, experts and people work together to promote inclusion, equality and justice. It also calls for environmental regeneration and protection of cultural heritage.

Once the project team agreed on the broader vision for Lahore, the next step was to suggest ways to make vision a reality. The following steps were considered necessary to achieve Lahore Vision 2035. Firstly, Lahore needs autonomous local governments to plan and implement urban development projects. In our view, the local governments can help reduce and eliminate institutional overlaps in service provision. They can also contribute in increasing responsiveness among the agencies and departments responsible for urban services. Local governments have greater legitimacy for they provide space to ordinary citizens in decision-making process. Secondly, the agencies and departments working for Lahore's development need to evolve local solutions to the problems of the city. Government agencies should learn from the communities and social welfare groups to innovate solutions. Thirdly, the solutions to the problems of the city should be affordable in economic sense. Expansive solutions are not sustainable. Changa Pani Program is a community-based, affordable, local solution to water wastage and cost recovery. Similarly, low-cost solutions are needed in transportation, health, education and sports. Low-cost solutions are particularly needed for housing and real estate sector. Fourthly, protection of environment needs to be embedded in all decisions related to urban development.

While working to achieve Lahore Vision 2035, it is also important to work to remove inequalities and deprivations on a spatial scale. Lahore needs to undertake spatial planning to identify inequalities and exclusions in urban services. In fact, spatial planning can help local governments in Lahore to allocate their financial resources prudently.

VISION

We envision Lahore becomes a pivot of economic, administrative, social, cultural and political inclusion. This entails that the governmental and non-governmental institutions work in sync to respond to the needs of the citizens and community's voice and participation shapes the future of the city.

We envision transparent and accountable decision-making that lends credibility to the institutions of governance and promotes effective coordination; empowering the citizens and the local governments to ensure that institutional overlapping is curbed to improve the governance, management and the delivery of services.

We envision Lahore becomes a city where local government structures are resilient; where efficient and affordable public transport is available; where carbon emissions are reduced; where residents of the city have widespread access to safe drinking water; where the conservation of natural water resources and curbing environmental degradation is ensured and sanitation services are streamlined; where rain water drains are planned, designed and managed effectively; where education, trade, manufacturing and entertainment grow; where housing is provided to all regardless of class; where cultural heritage is protected; where citizens can walk and bike safely; and, where tourist, trade and investment are safe and secure.

OVERVIEW

Lahore being the capital of Punjab for centuries has seen a number of dynasties. It holds a very significant position as the cultural, industrial and trading hub of Pakistan. It is situated as such that it has the potential of becoming a trading, cultural and intellectual center of Pakistan. To achieve excellence in intellectual, economic and social spheres, the city needs to foster equitable, inclusive and efficient economic growth and development so as to be able to provide housing, employment, trading and recreational amenities to the people residing in the city and to those migrating to the city. *The Program Design for Policy, Institutional and Regulatory Reform for the City of Lahore* aka Lahore Vision 2035 was designed to conduct research to

understand the existing policy, institutional, and regulatory framework of Lahore. The idea was that research could help us know how to use this existing framework to make Lahore more livable city where the basic amenities are available to all the people. It is of immense importance to improve the governance and management practices in Lahore as the city has immense potential to provide housing, employment, industrial, trading and tourism opportunities to millions of people residing, visiting and migrating to the city. Moreover, given the cultural, social and literary history and significance that Lahore historically holds, the city has great potential to become an international tourist destination.

DESIGN AND GOALS TO ACCOMPLISH THE VISION

The vision presented in this paper consolidates the visions of the following position papers:

1. Governance and Management in Lahore
2. Transport Planning in Lahore
3. Water, Sewerage and Solid Waste Management in Lahore
4. Real Estate Markets in Lahore
5. Improving Trade in Lahore Region

We believe these five sectors are the most important sectors in need of immediate reform and improvement to make Lahore more livable city. These sectors contribute to run a and connect a city. Together they can enable the city to function effectively and efficiently. The basic purpose of Lahore Vision 2035 is to provide the city planners and managers a blueprint on how to strategize and plan the future growth and direction of the city and towns surrounding it. In this spirit, the five chosen sectors offer immense potential for re-directing and re-designing the future of Lahore.

The following paragraphs provide an overview of the sectors that have been studied in detail. Table 1 is a blue print of the Lahore Vision 2035 that encompasses the findings and the recommendations as a way forward for the five components.

GOVERNANCE AND MANAGEMENT IN LAHORE

As Pakistan's economy changed from agrarian to a tertiary sector dominating economy, it has been

The division between the old city, the new modern developments in the city and the slums of the city echo deprivation, inequality and exclusion; and, therefore reflect poorly on the governance and management mechanism of Lahore. The decision making for the city is centralized by the Provincial Government.

engulfed with growing urbanization and unequal development in its major urban regions and Lahore has been no exception. As Lahore is expanding, its challenges are becoming more wide-ranging, varied, and fragmented. As the focus of development in the city has been on the increase in Gross Domestic Product and Gross National Product, migration to the city is increasing. Today, Lahore represents the two varied sections: a decaying old city and the modern well laid out city. The division between the old city, the new modern developments in the city and the slums of the city echo deprivation, inequality and exclusion; and, therefore reflect poorly on the governance and management mechanism of Lahore. The decision making for the city is centralized by the Provincial Government. Therefore, to address these issues, it is of extreme importance to provide a mechanism for an efficient system of local urban governance and management to empower the people and for the sustainable development of Lahore City and region.

A look into the existing situation of Lahore reflects that a substantial portion of the city is not being served by the Water and Sanitation Agency of Lahore. Water depletion, water contamination and illegal connections, water wastage and exclusion of low-income areas are some of the major issues facing water and sanitation management in Lahore.

TRANSPORT PLANNING IN LAHORE

The prevailing transportation system and situation in Lahore has a number of issues ranging from the overly crowded roads to inadequate capacity of the government to provide public transport to the public and the inability of the transport related agencies to coordinate to ensure adequate transport planning for the city. Therefore, Lahore has a chaotic, unplanned and inefficient transportation system with transportation departments lacking coordination, duplication of roles, outdated transport rules, absence of central repository data, inefficient land use, and ill-conceived adoption of motorization. These issues have led to dependency on cars, making pedestrian and bicycling extremely difficult. Therefore, we envision Lahore to establish public transport system in an affordable and equitable manner. We also envision that this transport system functions in harmony with the housing, educational, trading and economic centers of the city.

WATER SUPPLY, SEWERAGE AND SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT IN LAHORE

Water supply, sewerage, drainage and solid waste management of a city have multiple linkages with each other and they influence the social and economic life of a city. A look into the existing situation of Lahore reflects that a substantial portion of the city is not being served by the Water and Sanitation Agency of Lahore. Water depletion, water contamination and illegal connections, water wastage and exclusion of low-income areas are some of the major issues facing water and sanitation management in Lahore. Considering this, Lahore Vision 2035 advocates an equitable and inclusive approach to managing the

water and sanitation issues in the city, with the focus on providing universal amenities to these services and curtailing the damage caused by unmanaged solid and liquid waste.

REAL ESTATE MARKETS IN LAHORE

The real estate markets in Lahore, for both residential and commercial use, can be characterized by chaotic and unplanned development and therefore the city can be seen as an example of uncontrolled urban sprawl that has resulted in growing disparities amongst the people. Moreover, in the recent past, the city has seen prime agriculture land transformed into residential plots due to inadequate land management and zoning. Therefore, Lahore Vision 2035 attempts to provide a holistic and integrated planning approach that addresses the planning, development, housing and commercialization issues in the context of Lahore.

IMPROVING TRADE IN LAHORE REGION

Trade may be seen as a means to achieving justice, human, economic and environmental development by providing fair and equitable opportunities for people to grow. Moreover, trade as a sector is directly affected by the governance and management practices, access to transportation facilities and by the real estate market regulations. The performance of trade in Lahore region is a reflection of the working environment Lahore and cities around it. Therefore, to improve trade in Lahore region, Lahore needs to become a place where consumers and traders, both small and large, are protected; where transactions are made in fairness, where there are no market monopolies and where employees are treated with fairness and equity.

BLUEPRINT OF LAHORE VISION LAHORE 2035

Table 1 is an attempt to consolidate the research of the five sector papers. It showcases the existing situation and findings of each of the five sectors, and reflects upon where and how these issues need to be re-aligned in terms of the course the development of Lahore needs to take. The last column states a short vision statement imaging where we see the city to be in the year 2035 in terms of each sector.

TABLE 1: BLUEPRINT OF LAHORE VISION 2035

Sector	Issues/ Findings	Re-alignment	Vision
Governance and Management in Lahore	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Centralization, with majority of the powers lying with the provincial government. • Inequality and exclusion. • Economic, infrastructural and social segregation between the new and old Lahore. • No community participation in the decision-making process. • Overlapping and conflicting roles of government departments. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Institutionalize coordination mechanisms at city level which are above the changing political governments. • Produce local spatial evidence and environmental assessments for development. • Local representatives chalk out an area's development and funding priorities. • Direct services delivery. • Co-ordinated local authority engagement strategy with and performance evaluation by the public. 	Local governance management systems in Lahore that ensure devolution to guarantee the empowerment of the people of Lahore; these systems also make Lahore an equitable and inclusive city with sustainable development solutions. We also envision that the public institutions are empowered fiscally and their institutional capacity is developed allowing them to face the challenges of evolving times.
Transport Planning in Lahore	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Departmental overlaps and irregularities. • Economic and Social Exclusion. • Inequitable and exclusive transport planning policies that fail to address the needs of pedestrians and 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Instructional restructuring and coordination. • Affordable Public Transport. • Social awareness and education on road use, safety and discipline. • Inclusive and equitable 	Affordable and equitable transportation system, which is pedestrian and bicycle friendly and which functions in harmony with the housing, educational, trading and economic centers of the city.

	<p>cyclists.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Environmental degradation by promoting the motor vehicle culture in the city. • Lack of policies for rickshaws and Qingqis. • Lack of parking facilities that cause chaos and congestion. 	<p>road development with special space being allocated for pedestrians, bicycles and the disabled.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Environmental protection through discouraging motor vehicles and by promoting the culture of environmentally safe practices such as walking and bicycling. • Gender sensitized transport policy. 	
<p>Water, Sewerage and Solid Waste Management in Lahore</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • High exclusion and inequitable distribution of resources and services; estimates reveal that WASA and LWMC serve just over half of the city's population. • Extremely high ground water depletion. • Water contamination and illegal water connections. • Unaccounted for water due to inability of the public sector to ensure adequate water metering. • Small reservoir capacities with no standards present to ensure uniformity. • Extremely high levels of water being wasted on a daily basis. • Low water tariff rates. • Lack of coordination 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Devolution to ensure that WASA and LWMC work directly with the local and district governments to ensure accountability and the provision of services being with effectiveness. • Protection and enhancement of water resources. • Universal coverage of piped water supply on a sustainable basis. • Elimination of water contamination. • Water conservation to save water resources. • Inclusive and equitable development by ensuing community participation and awareness. • Well enforced laws to curb water theft and wastage, to ensure water metering and to ensure 	<p>Equitable and inclusive approach to managing the water and sanitation issues in the city with the focus being on providing universal amenities to these services and curtailing the damage caused by unmanaged solid and liquid waste.</p>

	<p>between WASA and LWMC.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Institutional weaknesses due to inadequate technical expertise and capabilities. 	<p>bill collection.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Ensure institutional reforms that allow WASA and LWMC to work in harmony and ensure the delivery of services. • Address the institutional and technical issues by building the capacity of employees. • Develop WASA to become a self-sustained, well capacitated and responsive water and sanitation agency. 	
<p>Real Estate Markets in Lahore</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Un-marked boundary of Lahore which is resulting in the extensive and unplanned growth of the city. • Existence of three independent bodies; LDA, DHA and Cantonment with varying by-laws and regulation extremely challenging and worrying. • LDA performing conflicting roles of being a regulator and a competitive service provider. • Uncontrolled urban sprawl which is fueling the economic and social disparity. • Increasing inability of the residents to purchase property in Lahore due to mounting land and 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Mark the boundary for Lahore to control the sprawl of the city. • Move towards high density development. • Standardization of real estate, building and zoning laws to develop a comprehensive institutional framework to ensure regulation of procedures for LDA, DHA and cantonment areas. • Ensure effective regulatory framework to guarantee delivery of services and accountability. • Ensure protection and preservation of the environment through regulating real estate markets and building and development in the city. 	<p>A holistic, integrated, equitable, inclusive, and decentralized planning approach and mechanisms that address the planning, development, housing and commercialization issues in the context of Lahore.</p>

	<p>housing prices caused by speculation and growing investment in the sector.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Growing squatter settlements due to the lack of provision of low-cost housing in the city. • Use of prime agriculture land for the development of housing schemes. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Inclusive and equitable development by providing medium and low cost housing. • Ensuring a conducive property tax regime through decentralization. • Ensure effective legislation to protect agriculture land from being converted into housing schemes. • Introduce legislation that ensures that 80 percent of all housing schemes are inhabited to end speculation and artificial price hikes in the market. 	
<p>Improving Trade in Lahore Region</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Inability of the public sector to strengthen trade by providing effective regulatory and implementing mechanisms. • Extremely difficult to start a new business in Lahore. • Cost of doing business extremely high. • Excess to land and finance extremely difficult. • Contract enforcement is enormously challenging. • Land allocated to commercial activities is either insufficient or underutilized. • Trade, leisure, housing 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Ensuring mechanisms to bridge the gap between the government and traders. • Ensure deregulation by the establishment of independent government departments to ensure departmental democracy. • Economic integration of Lahore region to attract investment to the city and to develop trading niches and also to facilitate trade between India and Pakistan. • Introduce commerce based spatial planning by creating trade-oriented land-use plans, zoning and building 	<p>Envisions trade in Lahore to become a place where consumers and traders are protected, where transactions are made in fairness, where there are no market monopolies and where employees are treated with fairness and equity.</p>

and economic centers not well connected.

- Safety and security issues to traders and consumers, especially women and children.

regulations.

- Regulate commercial buildings and reduce encroachments.
- Improve the storage and circulation of goods by providing storage space by establishing warehouses.
- Improve legal services and tax collection.
- Facilitate access to finance and insurance.
- Ensure that Lahore is secure by improving social integration and disaster fighting.
- Raise awareness about consumer protection.
- Create government-trader synergies to prevent government-trader confrontation, to facilitate market committees, regulate trade associations and facilitate Traders Cooperatives.

STRATEGY TO PURSUE LAHORE VISION 2035

Lahore Vision 2035 has been developed with great deliberation and reflection by relevant stakeholders. Table 2 presents information on the number of seminars and consultations conducted as part of our research work.

TABLE 2: CONSULTATIONS AND SEMINARS

Activity	Governance and Management in Lahore	Transport Planning in Lahore	Water, Sewerage & Solid Waste in Lahore	Real Estate Markets in Lahore	Improving Trade in Lahore Region
Interviews with concerned departments	2	12	15	4	15
Informal group discussions with citizens		4	5		6
Interviews/ Discussions with mentors	3	5	5	5	7
Consultative seminars	1	1	1	1	1
Public seminars	1	1	1	1	1
Total	7	23	27	11	30
Core Group Meetings	4				

Decentralization thus is the key to equitable, inclusive and prosperous development of Lahore. The provincial government needs to devolve the powers to the local centers as to empower the people and to enable them to address their issues. This would not only ease the governance and management of Lahore but would take away the burden from public departments and would ensure the direct delivery of services.

The purpose of conducting these seminars and for arranging public meeting was not only to gather the knowledge of the predicaments in Lahore; it was also to advocate the Lahore Vision 2035. It was an attempt to raise awareness about the current development trends in Lahore and to articulate if the city was moving in the right direction. The meeting and consultations thus helped us establish that over the past decade, the governance mechanism in Lahore has pivoted towards infrastructural development. This pivot was found to be astounding because research reflected that the infrastructural development was being done at the cost of social development of the inhabitants of the city. Statistics reflected that the city that had been deficient in providing basic amenities such as clean drinking water, sanitation facilities, housing and lodging facilities, safe and affordable transportation facilities and food and social security to more than one third of its population, was spending exorbitant sums on developing road infrastructure. Thus, our research reflected that the city of Lahore has failed to deliver to the public; the city has not been developing to

serve the common man; rather it is developing to serve the ruling elite and the prosperous sections. The development initiatives over the previous years have failed to address the needs of the marginalized members of the society and therefore, we propose that the development in the city should not only become equitable and inclusive; the development decisions should be done by the people of the city, for the people of the city. Decentralization thus is the key to equitable, inclusive and prosperous development of Lahore. The provincial government needs to devolve the powers to the local centers as to empower the people and to enable them to address their issues. This would not only ease the governance and management of Lahore but would take away the burden from public departments and would ensure the direct delivery of services. It is also likely to ensure high levels of financial accountability and efficiency. Devolution would help to fit services to local needs and preferences and thereby work to strengthen the governance and management systems at the provincial center.

A LOOK AT THE DEVELOPMENT PLANNING IN LAHORE

This chapter includes analysis of the development plans of Lahore, i.e., the Master Plan for Lahore, the Transport Master Plan for Lahore, the local government laws and other development plans that have been developed for the city of Lahore. This chapter summarizes what lacks in the ways planning for Lahore is done and governance is practiced.

Through the course of this research, a number of development plans were studied with the idea to understand the development strategies for Lahore and the vision for the city. The plans included the Local Government Ordinances for the years 1960, 1979 and 2001; The Master Plans for Lahore such as Master Plan for Greater Lahore (1972), Structure Plan of Lahore (1984) and Integrated Master Plan for Lahore-2021 (2002).

The following tables and paragraphs would provide an overview of the salient features of these development plans, their projected vision and would look to see if the vision proposed in these plans materialized or not.

Table 3: Local Government Ordinances

Ordinances	Year	Key Points	Goal/Vision
Municipal Administration Ordinance	1960	Provided guidelines to implement and run local governments with detailed proposals to make water, sanitation, food regulation, horticulture, education, public safety, public health, collection of municipal taxation and development, as local government subjects. Preparation of master plans by local councils.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> To decentralize governance and management in Pakistan. Provision for the preparation of master plans by local councils.
Provincial Local Government Ordinance (PLGO)	1979	Provided procedure to run local governments under the Provincial Government; the Provincial Government given the authority to dismiss the Local Government. PLGO was based on rural-urban divide.	To establish Local Government systems that would be headed by the Provincial Governments.

Local Government Ordinance	2001	Article 140A required provincial governments to 'devolve political, administrative and financial authority and responsibility to the elected representatives of local governments'. It made the DCO accountable to the district Nazim. It also did away with rural urban divide that was created in the PLGO 1979.	To devolve political, administrative and financial authority and responsibility to the elected representatives of local governments.
Punjab Local Government Ordinance	2013	Introduces mayors, deputy mayors, chairmen and vice chairmen under indirect election system. The chief minister appoints the heads of the Lahore Development Authority, Traffic Engineering & Planning Agency, Parks & Horticulture Authority, Lahore Waste Management Company, Lahore Transport Company, Lahore Parking Company, Punjab Food Authority, Rescue 1122, the Walled City of Lahore Authority and the district education and health authorities. The chief minister would also be able to suspend the mayor, deputy mayor and chairmen. A local fund was to be formed for every local council and the fund would be utilized at the direction of the provincial government. Different systems were sanctioned for rural and urban areas and a different system was enacted for Lahore	To introduce amendments in the local government laws, with the vision to strengthen the provincial government in the presence of a local government.

The above table provides a summary of the Local Government Laws that have been enacted in Lahore over the previous decades. General Ayub Khan, General Zia-ul-Haq, and President Pervez Musharraf established Local Government Ordinances during their dictatorships to sanction their own military rules and therefore it was seen that none of the democratically elected governments looked to conduct Local Body elections. Thereby, until recently, the local government ordinances only held merit during martial law regimes.

Moreover, the only legislation with provision for the preparation of master plans by local councils was the Municipal Administration Ordinance (MAO) 1960. However, as it did not clarify the process of plan sanction, implementation and revision if needed, the MAO also failed to empower the Local Governments with the authority to develop their own vision as to how they wanted to develop their respective areas. The MAO was replaced by Provincial Local Government Ordinance (PLGO) 1979 which carried forward the provisions of MAO 1960 about master planning in almost the same words. With the exception of the Local Government Ordinance (2001), the implementation of which suffered the fate of lack of political will, the federal government acted as a centralized entity till the 18th Amendment Bill was passed.

Furthermore, with regards to PLGO 2001, its main drawback was that it never devolved the financial powers envisaged under the Ordinance to the local government. The result of the above situation did not bode well for effective urban development or governance and management of urban areas in Pakistan. It especially exacerbated local issues of the common person like waste management, potable water supply, housing, transport and parking etc. Moreover, although the 18th Amendment sanctioned to develop Local Governments and to conduct Local Body Elections with urgency, the provincial governments failed to have taken up the role and kept the power centralized by not conducting Local Body elections and thereby to date Local government elections have not been held in Pakistan since 2008.

NEED FOR PLANNING AND DESIGN

As the previous section stated, this project was developed in realization to the need of the city's requirement of a Vision for the future development. Therefore, even though a number of development plans that majorly focused on the infrastructural development of the city and service provision of the city have failed to provide a direction to the development of the city. Thereby, although these plans had very clearly chalked out governance and management initiatives that needed to be taken to decentralize the governance systems and with clear infrastructural development; they did not provide solutions and resolutions for the existing situation.

Since Pakistan's independence the efforts to develop Lahore have mainly comprised making and implementing Master Plans for the development and growth of the city. These include the Master Plan 1966, Master Plan for Greater Lahore 1972, Structure Plan of Lahore 1984, and the Integrated Master Plan for Lahore-2021 in 2002. The Master Plan for Greater Lahore was finalized in 1966, but its approval and implementation remained pending till 1972. A major weakness of the plan was the overlapping function and territories for Lahore Improvement Trust (LIT) and Lahore Municipal Corporation (LMC). Lack of effective legal powers for implementation with regards to both the above entities rendered the plan ineffective. The merger of the two was envisaged in the plan but did not happen and eventually LIT became the Lahore Development Authority (LDA) in 1975.

The LMC continued following the plan but LDA did not and got prepared Lahore Urban Development and Traffic Study in 1980.¹ This plan comprised a structural plan with a time span of 1981-2000. However, it did not gain a legal status except as a guiding framework for LDA. Thus, two plans were being followed by two organizations with intersecting functions and territories without appropriate mechanisms for coordination. As this plan was drawing to a close in 1997, the LDA entrusted the task of devising a new plan for Lahore to NESPAK.² This was finalized in 2002 as Integrated

Master Plan for Lahore-2021. However, during its preparation and finalization, the status of LDA and Local Government set up of Lahore changed due to the implementation of the Local Government Ordinance-2001.

attempt to address the governing issues in Public Departments in Lahore, lack of coordination between LDA and CDGL still stands as a major weakness in the governing structure of Lahore. Various topics covered by the plans fell under the domain of

Over the decades, the development in Lahore and around its peripheries has been, and continues to be chaotic and unplanned, where the planning and development decisions of the city have been directed by the whims of the political elite, rather than on being directed by the needs of the people of the city. Consecutive Governments and the city planning departments have lacked the understanding to preserve the soul and feel of Lahore city.

The IMPL-2021, in spite of being comprehensive compared to the previous plans, could not establish a coordination mechanism for working with the various departments of the provincial and local government suggested in the form of a Master Plan Committee in the plan. Furthermore, implementation of envisaged plans suffered due to unnecessary delays in preparation and approval process, inadequate financial resources, legal omissions, and above all lack of political will.³ Since 2011-2012, LDA and CDGL are endeavoring to revise the IMPL-2021 on the grounds that it lacks:⁴ Disaster Risk Reduction (DRR) framework, metropolitan regional planning, primary data, saving cultural heritage; inclusion of three more towns to the six since 2005, use of public space; traffic flow, finalizing boundaries/revenue limits. Other issues include control of schemes/towns towards city's south for the upcoming free trade proposal between Pakistan and India through the Wagah Border, agricultural land being converted to residential areas on Multan, Raiwind and Ferozpur roads.⁵

Thus, the lack of political will in implementing the Master Plans and the inability of the planners to effectively incorporate the public opinion in the development of the Master Plans have majorly contributed towards the failure of these plans to materialize. Moreover, although these plans did

different government departments and thus reflected an overlap. For example, the Plan proposes that the CDGL should be networked with the Revenue Department, responsible for registering the sale/purchase of land and controlling illegal land subdivisions. However, such networking arrangements have not been made.⁶ Thus, implementation has suffered due to unnecessary delays in preparation and approval process, inadequate financial resources, legal omissions, and above all lack of political will.

In lieu of the inability of the above discussed Government Ordinances and Master Plans to provide a direction for the planning and development for Lahore City, the development of the Lahore Vision 2035 was deemed necessary. Over the decades, the development in Lahore and around its peripheries has been, and continues to be chaotic and unplanned, where the planning and development decisions of the city have been directed by the whims of the political elite, rather than on being directed by the needs of the people of the city. Consecutive Governments and the city planning departments have lacked the understanding to preserve the soul and feel of Lahore city. The development Vision Lahore 2035 is thereby an effort to provide a direction for the planning and development work that is being done and that needs to be done in the city.

COMPONENTS OF LAHORE VISION 2035

This chapter delineates following components of Lahore Vision. These components are common to all of the five sector position papers written for the project. By extension, these components may be used to improve other sectors too.

LOCAL GOVERNMENTS

Lahore needs strong local governments for transport planning, markets, water & sanitation. The governance system of a city is the umbrella under which all the departments work to keep the city functioning well and flourish and therefore, only through a strong local governance system, can the issues in Lahore be resolved. However, the governance systems in Lahore have not managed to evolve with changing times due to the inability of the consecutive provincial governments to deregulate and conduct local government elections and therefore, Punjab is said to have become increasingly centralized under the current political regime.

Although, it may be argued that the centralized systems of governance have merits; the decentralized models of governance in a vastly urbanizing and growing Lahore with its limited resources may be a very effective tool of delivery as the system ensures that the needs of the people are effectively recognized and met. The decentralized systems of governance operate at a local level and the governing members of the areas are more aware of the needs of local people.

In the case of Lahore, decentralization may be the key to the success as research reflected that at the provincial and at the district level, there are

In the case of Lahore, decentralization may be the key to the success as research reflected that at the provincial and at the district level, there are a number of departments that are performing overlapping functions and hence that are working analogously to achieve similar, overlapping and sometimes conflicting outcomes. A major reason of this outcome is the centralization of the departments at the provincial level.

a number of departments that are performing overlapping functions and hence that are working analogously to achieve similar, overlapping and sometimes conflicting outcomes. A major reason of this outcome is the centralization of the departments at the provincial level and therefore, a strong local government is the only solution through which it can be ensured that the provision of transport, housing, clean and safe drinking water and sanitation, solid waste management and trading facilities are provided to the local people in an efficient manner. The paragraphs below would explain how a decentralized system of governance can help improve service provision for all the sectors of our research.

A framework for local governance for Lahore functioning under a mayor and with a team of local area representatives working under him needs

to be developed that would enable the government authorities to identify the needs of residents eloquently and would enable them to harmonize between the transport, housing, trading and water and sewerage departments. Through the local governance system, as the agencies would work under and the mayor, the transportation services would be connected to the trading centers and housing authorities and would be a response to the demand on the particular route. The housing would be near the working centers and therefore would considerably lower the cost of travelling and would reduce the volume of traffic on the streets. The city would also have a number of planned trading centers that would be able to cater to the residents of the adjoining areas and thereby increase trading opportunities for investors and reduce trading costs for consumers. Only under a strong local government can the planning and coordination between departments be improved and the focus of the development can shift from major infrastructural development to making Lahore an integrated and impeccably functioning city.

For a transport friendly and savvy Lahore, the transportation needs of the city need to be understood as providing transportation for ten million people is no easy feat. The focus of providing transportation facilities to the city should thereby not only to develop the infrastructure of the city; they should be focused at providing easy, viable, environmentally friendly and cheap transportation facilities to the travelers.

Transport planning departments in Lahore need to be coordinated and regularized as to ensure that the overlap in planning and the lack of coordination in these departments can be addressed. These departments currently separately perform the functions of planning, engineering, maintenance, licensing, registration and regulation which cause overlaps and should be consolidated into one single authority that overlooks the planning and development of transport in Lahore.

We propose that the mayor of Lahore is empowered to conduct the planning and development exercises with the recommendations and participation of the

local elected representatives as the local representatives would be able to identify the transport needs for their areas. Moreover, it should be ensured that the development funds are distributed among the local representatives to ensure that the development work is carried out through them. It will help ensuring efficient delivery of services to the local people. Moreover, decentralizing the transport department could also ensure that rather than concentrating on the development projects in Lahore, they would be able to concentrate on ensuring the provision of better transportation services to the citizens of Lahore.

Government's role should be improved in Lahore's economy, the local government rather than the provincial government should be able to make decisions for the trade and economic development of the city as only then would the decisions reflect the needs and aspirations of the people of the city. Therefore, the Metropolitan Corporation Lahore should work to improve the trading and business activities in Lahore. Decentralization would not only help lower transaction costs, it would help ensure ease of business in the city and would be able to regulate markets and ensure the provision of trading facilities in response to the demands of the local areas.

Moreover, strengthening the Local Government system in Lahore would also ensure that the water, sanitation and sewerage conditions of the city, which are repulsive in slums and Kachi Abadis in Lahore can be immensely improved as the CDGL can ensure that the water and sewerage networks in Lahore are developed and are connected to the main waste disposal lines, which the Water and Sanitation Agency Lahore has failed to achieve as their coverage area does not match with the boundaries of the city. Thus, local governments are the only solution to ensuring that both the developed and the underdeveloped areas of Lahore are provided with safe and clean drinking water and are provided with sanitation facilities.

Lahore needs affordable solutions in transport, solid waste, and utilities. Affordable economic solutions are the key to sustainable development in Lahore as the city is growing at an astounding rate, especially due to inland migration. The increasing dependence on the limited resource base of the city is causing strain on the existing infrastructure.

LOCAL SOLUTIONS

Lahore needs to build on its own strengths in facilities such as solid waste management and pedestrianism. Government of Pakistan generally, and Government of the Punjab specifically have been bringing in international expertise to resolve the problems of Pakistan and more specifically Lahore. From the Metro Bus Service to the Lahore Waste Management Company, Government of the Punjab has been importing development solutions to the city. The Lahore Vision 2035 however stresses that there are a number of local development solutions that can be adopted. These development solutions not only pose successful examples, they provide cheap alternatives to both social and economic development.

One such example that may be is the Changa Pani Program which is a community based development program. It is based on component sharing approach by which internal, i.e., lane and neighborhood level water and sewerage infrastructure development is the responsibility of the local people and the external, i.e., the trunk sewers, disposal stations, treatment plants, tube wells and the rising main are the responsibility of the government. Local communities operate and maintain water and sanitation systems through their representative community organizations. This approach not only makes communities self-reliant, it also helps reduce the delivery burden on the government agencies, and moreover strengthens

the relationship between communities and implementing organizations. Therefore, WASA, in collaboration with the Urban Unit has successfully implemented this model in Badir Colony where Water and Sanitation Community Organization is operating and maintaining water and sewerage systems and generating a profit. Therefore, the City District Government Lahore should also look to adapt the Changa Pani Program as it would help WASA increase its coverage area. With the help of the CDGL, WASA can also look to increase its revenue generation as the people would be more willing to pay for services they have an ownership stake in.

Developing pedestrian friendly roads, foot paths and encouraging the use of cycles is another major step that the developers of Lahore need to take. Historically, the city had a large pedestrian and cycling population that that preferred to travel by foot or to cycle. However, decades later, the urban and developed Lahore presents itself to be a city that is inhabited by people that take pride in using expensive private cars and feel shame in both walking and cycling. Thereby, taking a hint from a few hundred thousand dwellers in the city, the new development plans have failed to include the provision of developing foot paths and road space for pedestrians and cyclists. Thereby, anyone who chooses to walk or to cycle to the nearest corner shop must do so on the main road, under the gleam of extremely dangerous fast moving traffic. Thereby, like a number of internationally thriving and culturally rich cities such as London and Paris, Lahore needs to promote both walking and cycling as respectable and highly regarded modes of transportation so to make it socially acceptable for people to ride cycles and walk.

ECONOMIC AFFORDABILITY

Lahore needs affordable solutions in transport, solid waste, and utilities. Affordable economic solutions are a key to sustainable development in Lahore as the city is growing at an astounding rate, especially due to inland migration. The increasing dependence on the limited resource base of the city is causing strain on the existing infrastructure. Moreover, the city is

Economic affordability is extremely relevant to the Real Estate Markets in Lahore as it is the need of the day to say that adequate and affordable housing is made available to all income groups residing in the city. Land value, over the past few decades, has emerged as the prime factor in land use and zoning, instead of public priorities and planning considerations.

split into posh localities and struggling vicinities that include slums and underdeveloped areas and thereby, affordable and sustainable development solutions in the provision of goods and services is the key to an inclusive, equitable and prospering Lahore.

The Position paper entitled *Improving Trade in Lahore Region* provides evidence that financing, registering, running and establishing a business in the city is not just an extremely taxing task, it is also extremely expensive. Therefore, Lahore needs to develop workable and sustainable systems to ensure that starting and running a business in Lahore becomes affordable. Moreover, workable solutions need to be developed to provide affordable systems of goods storage and circulation and systems need to be streamlined to ensure that trade flows are made easier and faster as the ease of trade flows would help the economy grow by increasing the mobility of tradable goods and services. Moreover, the easier the circulation of goods and services, the lesser the transaction costs and the more economically affordable trade would be likely to become.

The key to developing systems that ensure economic affordability would be to develop value and supply chains and improve the transportation of goods. Improved value chains, like the one K&N has established in Pakistan, can considerably reduce the amount of time and money involved in getting hold of goods for production and trading purposes.

Moreover, poor transportation facilities hinder trade flows immensely and thereby considerably raise the cost of trading in Lahore as the government provides no reliable means of transportation of goods is available and therefore, an effective and efficient transportation system needs to be developed that enables traders to transport goods into and out of Lahore at nominal rates. Lastly, to make trade affordable and flourish in Lahore, warehouse and storage facilities need to be provided to the small, medium and large traders as warehouse facilities in Lahore are very few and those that do exist, are available at exorbitant prices.

Furthermore, in the Water and Sewerage sector, the Punjab Government is the process of launching water filtration plants at 3000 locations in Punjab at the cost of a 10 Billion Rupees. We believe that the water filtration plants, as introduced by the Pervez Musharraf Government, are a very expensive solution to providing safe drinking water to the masses as both the installation costs and the maintenance costs are huge. Thus the previous plants installed by the Musharraf government are mostly non-functional. Moreover, water purification plants are not a sustainable solution as they do not remove the cause of water contamination. Therefore, we believe, for water purification, the Government should look to tackle the sources of water contamination; which is being caused by old galvanized pipes that had been laid out at least thirty five years ago. As these pipes have become porous and hence cause dust and foul water mix with the clean water. Therefore, the local governments should look to replace old water pipelines as it would be both a sustainable and an affordable solution and should not look to invest in imported water filtration plants that are both expensive to install and operate.

Economic affordability in the transportation sector is crucial as the provision of public transport would only be effective if it is provided to the public at affordable rates. Therefore, the provincial and local governments should focus on low cost and economically efficient projects and the focus of the development should thereby shift from road development to the provision

of public transport. The Government should not also focus on the provision of a variety of public transport facilities that are not necessarily transit-oriented and thus operates on smaller routes and is less expensive and offers an affordable solution to the public.

Economic affordability is extremely relevant to the Real Estate Markets in Lahore as it is the need of the day to say that adequate and affordable housing is made available to all income groups residing in the city. Land value, over the past few decades, has emerged as the prime factor in land use and zoning, instead of public priorities and planning considerations. The real estate markets in Lahore have become the leading speculative and lucrative markets for developers and investors in Pakistan. Therefore, due to land speculation and private investors investing in the real estate markets in Lahore, the land prices have become exorbitantly high and therefore it has become impossible for a middle income household to own property in the city. Moreover, as land prices continue to increase and so does inland migration, the past decades have seen the development of kactchi abadis and informal settlements all over Lahore.

Therefore, the Local Government needs to rigorously regulate the real estate markets, commercialization, unplanned residential areas and land speculation to keep the prices of land under check. Moreover, as land passes through several hands, each transaction leads to its value addition. Land consolidation is started by the patwari, acquisition costs are added by the developer, plotting and infrastructure costs are added, housing units, commercial buildings, plazas and leisure facilities further increase costs and therefore contribute to the high housing costs in the real estate and retail markets. The government should therefore look to regulate the market and thereby achieve the international ratio of 10:90, with the land value at 10 percent and the value of the construction being 90 percent of the total cost of owning a house. Thereby, such a regulatory policy would be able to ensure that owning property in Lahore can be made more reasonably priced and affordable.

ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION

Lahore needs to build environment friendly practices in governance and service delivery. Environmental protection is the key to the sustainability and survival of a city and therefore, environment friendly practices in the governance and service industry can ensure the sustainable development of Lahore.

Water conservation and water wastage are major issues impacting Lahore as underground water tables in Lahore have considerably depleted. This situation may pose a huge survival issue in the near future. Moreover, water discharge and recharge are interlinked. The population of Lahore is exceeding 10 million and therefore both the residing population of the city and about 2000 industrial units contribute to the waste water discharge into River Ravi. On the other hand, Water and Sanitation Agency (WASA) uses 467 tube wells to extract water from underground. Therefore, there is no mechanism that is in place to artificially recharge the existing aquifers of the city and the existing water aquifer is depleting at an astounding rate of 2 feet per year. The situation is severe: not only is the ground water depleting, the aquifer zones are also depleting.

Lahore, a culturally vibrant city has had a pedestrian culture where pedestrians were a center of the social and economic activity. However, over the years this culture was over taken by motor vehicles and sadly now, decades later, a majority of the roads in the city do not have footpaths and zebra crossings for pedestrians to walk on. Therefore, traffic management and enforcement in Lahore needs immediate attention, with a major focus on pedestrian and bicycle path development, with the focus to shift the dependency on motor vehicles to more environmentally friendly and sustainable means of communication. Moreover, encouraging pedestrian friendly passages and roads would not only help revive the culture of the city, it would help lower pollution and carbon footprint levels too.

Furthermore, the architectural gems of the city need to be reserved and protected and therefore their location should be considered before any

Lahore's present vertical governance pattern is unable to incorporate the participation of a growing number of increasingly diverse interest entities and groups. The challenges surrounding participation are particularly acute for marginalized groups, such as the urban poor and ethnic and religious minorities.

infrastructure development or transport planning initiative is taken around these heritage sites. The transport planning departments should thus focus on minimizing carbon emissions, air and noise pollution and focus on promoting environmental friendly means of transport. Therefore, there is a need for a paradigm shift from road widening as the sole solution of transportation problems to people centric and environmental friendly approaches.

In order to make trade sustainable and environmentally safe in Lahore, the CDGL should immediately undertake measures to preserve and protect the environment of the city. Immediate steps need to be taken to reduce the pollution generated by the trade related processes such as manufacturing processes and product making as environmental hazards not only harm the environment, they also harm the economy and the society. Therefore, if trade has to be sustainable, all trade related processes should contribute to protect the environment.

Furthermore, a number of trading markets in Lahore produce environmentally hazardous effects. Of the predominant markets, Sabzi Mandi and the Cattle Market take a lead as these markets produce a lot of solid waste which is never properly disposed of. Moreover, although a number of other markets do not directly generate environmental waste, they have damaging impacts on the environment. Furthermore, as a majority of the trading markets do not have adequate restroom and water arrangements, waste disposal is a major concern for these markets.

Environmental sustainability in the context of Land Use, Building Control and Zoning takes on a very serious issue of agriculturally cultivatable land being used to develop housing societies and being sold as commercial properties. Several decades are

required before a piece of agriculture land completes its land use cycle. However, mushrooming housing and development societies, such as the Gulberg Town which was developed on agriculture land, are becoming beacons of economic growth and development. Preservation of prime agriculture land, such as the agriculture land being used to develop the LDA City Project was responsible for providing a large share of the vegetables to Lahore city, and sustainable villages around the peripheries of Lahore should be a priority for the government and they should not be used to develop housing societies, develop industrial zones or built power projects. Strict laws should thus govern prime cultivatable land that is the solitary source of lively hood.

HORIZONTAL INSTEAD OF VERTICAL GOVERNANCE FOR COMPLIANCE & ENFORCEMENT ⁷

A consequence of the focus on city-regions within the economic framework necessitates that the national macro-economic structure and environment be strengthened. Also the basis of the micro-economy, i.e. local economic sectors needs to be made resilient to bear this consideration. How well does urban governance, responsible for the efficiency and effectiveness of provincial and local authorities, respond to this need? What kind of urban governance is required to enhance competitiveness and opportunities? Such an economic framework has a reverse side effect on city sustainability e.g. fragmentation and segregation, social exclusion and lack of space. It also leads to changes in a city's social fabric such as urbanization, rural-urban migration and thus the need for sustainable solutions for spatial problems.

Lahore's present vertical governance pattern is

unable to incorporate the participation of a growing number of increasingly diverse interest entities and groups. The challenges surrounding participation are particularly acute for marginalized groups, such as the urban poor and ethnic and religious minorities. At the moment in Lahore, ineffective and small local government units and its employees find it hard to draw in and develop the administrative and technical resources required for governance and management of the type required by Lahore. Also the private sector has become an increasingly important stakeholder in governance.

- Thus, the elected governments need to increase and give authority to local governments to check urban sprawl which can be deterred by co-operative action between all these levels and will improve social, territorial and environmental issues of the city.
- The overlap issues in function, coordination between provincial and local government should be removed with clear tasks and jobs to be taken up by a single relevant authority with regards to the private and local domain working with/ under the local government.

Lahore can look to a growing range and number of governance models for cities. These integrate expertise about governance and management. However, variables like size and contextual realities of Lahore need to be considered on their own merit.

REMOVE SOCIAL, ECONOMIC AND SPATIAL INEQUALITIES

Addressing the present legal informality in Lahore's government's structure ought to be one of the highest priorities for good governance in Lahore. Good governance initiatives can thus only be successful if the government moves in to intervene to remove social, special and economic disparities through interventions and public expenditure divisions to combat problems, such as low-income housing, access to safe drinking water and sanitation facilities, economic public transportation, crime, education and health needs.

Thereby, at present Lahore is segregated by developed and under-developed regions in the city. Fragmented governance has exacerbated the disadvantages of the poor in obtaining public services whereas, in the newly developed parts of Lahore that include DHA, Cantonment and new housing societies offer affluent communities opportunities and incentives to separate themselves from the older, decaying Lahore.

Therefore, the equitable and inclusive provision of amenities, especially public goods to the city should be the Vision of development for the year 2035 and this vision can only be achieved by strengthening local government and by promoting power sharing in key economic, social and political sectors of development.

TRANSFORM THE UNION COUNCIL THROUGH EQUITABLE MUNICIPAL FINANCE

Local government performs both governance and management roles: the management role of local government lies in the service delivery and enforcement of regulations. In Lahore, before independence, local functions like roads, water supply, drainage, sanitation and street lighting were under the municipal government. Today these functions have been diverted to various authorities (recently to the companies like the Lahore Transport Company). This has led to fragmented planning and management of these services. Also the focus on privatization has converted government and private sector monopolies. These institutions lack citizen participation, transparency and accountability. Coupled with this, Pakistan's weak democratic history has rendered government role at union council level, at best, feeble. In other words the governance systems are not sufficiently gelled together with local government. This reduces choices for the consumers.

- Currently the levying and distribution of local taxes is either provincial or central undertaking. The union council has no authority to sanction estimates and plans for union council level works. There is no obligation on the planning or administrative departments at the provincial

As far as security issues are concerned, at present, residents of an area have no power to decide the effective use the police force allocated to their area. This does not bode well for the counter terrorism measures introduced at the district level or responding to citizens' security requirements in a residential area

level to allocate funds to the union council. This level of government does not have adequate financial resources. This leads to a shortage of funds for operational and management services as the union council are unable to replace street lights, faulty pipes. Thus public services have deteriorated. Mechanism for municipal finance should be introduced, including provision of endowment funds. Union councils should be empowered to raise their own funds through fees and taxes as follows: use of commercial areas and street markets; parking vehicles in public spaces; charges to right of entry to parks and other common areas; tax on advertisements in public spaces; levy a flat per-head charge on the population of a union council according to the income generated by the settlers (DHA, Model Town, Gulbarg high-end residents and businesses ought to be paying more taxes), private service/ utilities providers e.g. garbage collectors can pay a fee to the union council as tax. These taxes and fees should be according to the existing social and territorial diversity, i.e., elite; middle and poor areas pay for services and utilities based on equitable prescriptions. Such a scenario will be better for the governance and management of slum areas.

- Planning, designing and contracting service delivery and regulation issues should be done at the union council which will promote competition, flexibility and transparency.
- Union councils should be partners and regulators in union council markets with local rules/ regulation and assigning space to street vendors/ hawkers who are a part of the culture of Lahore. Local parks and the parking for above spaces should also be managed at this level.

- As far as security issues are concerned, at present, residents of an area have no power to decide the effective use the police force allocated to their area. This does not bode well for the counter terrorism measures introduced at the district level or responding to citizens' security requirements in a residential area. If a police station is under the control of the union council, decisions related to policing can be taken by the local residents. This will also bring the police closer to the citizens and increase cooperation between them.

Managing public services at union council level would reflect the hopes and desires of the local people, who are the direct stakeholders in such services. Good governance at this level will create competition among union council and improve service delivery. The PLGO 2013 should be amended suitably to incorporate the proposals made above.

INVIGORATED SPATIAL PLANNING

Realizing the importance of spatial planning information, in 2001, Government of Pakistan made it mandatory for every local council to prepare GIS based land information system within three years. But so far, local authorities with limited skills and resources have not made any mentionable progress in this regard. Recently, as part of urban sector reform project in collaboration with World Bank under Punjab Cities Governance Improvement Project (PCGIP), The Urban Unit has initiated this in major cities of Punjab. In 2007, Department of Revenue, Punjab had started Land Record Management and Information Systems Project. It is to be noted that both projects are at provincial level. Both focus on one aspect (land record) of spatial information, whereas planners and decision makers require

varied type of current spatial information from departments at national, provincial to local level in an appropriate format. Current situation of Lahore clearly reflects that no attention has been given to the growth, expansion and sustainability of urban space. The result is the growth of unorganized slums; commercial and trading activities, concentrated in the inner core of the city causing congestion and strain on urban services network.

- World over, the introduction of spatial planning has been part of public service reform. This trend is set within an increasing focus on localized or decentralized solutions. Local authorities are now charged with the role of government and governance. This increases the role of spatial planning at local level which is concerned with place shaping, encompassing all aspects of life in a locality. Apart from the focus on local level planning there is an increasing trend to connect the public sector to the local authority from the perspective of the user, i.e., individual, community, business, and place.

The themes of a good local government model for good governance would be about joining up local authorities and the wider public sector around people, places and businesses, with the longer term economic growth of the area as the basis for the reforms on governance, efficiency and integration.

- Planners have not been accustomed to viewing local government as a vehicle for reform of the planning system. Nevertheless, the role of spatial planning is one of the key delivery means to achieve good governance.

AIM FOR SUSTAINABLE LAHORE

A common perception about living in a city is that it would reduce vulnerability in different aspects, including lower rates of disease and better access to health services. Increasingly, however, more than 70% of urban developing country populations now live in slum-like conditions; with low incomes, poor housing and provision of basic services, and without effective regulation of pollution or ecosystem

degradation. If rapid urbanization focuses only on short-term economic development rather than sustainability, this is likely to lead to development paths that exacerbate climate change with, largely negative, implications for sustainable cities. Prospects for effective governance within cities are provided by national policies and provincial government. For example, implementation of national environmental laws can be facilitated by appropriate local planning; or a social welfare policy can be coordinated with local educational policy. The link between environment and energy policies, climate change, and health policy creates both a need and an opportunity for urban planners to develop methods for assessing complex risks and to engage more actively in development decisions. Decisions taken in cities should support a preventive environmental agenda and serve the ultimate goal of promoting human health and well-being. Cities in developing countries are both vulnerable and increasingly exposed to climatic threats like heat waves, floods and storms, communicable diseases and air pollution.

Lahore is no exception. It has been a victim of dengue epidemic since the past few years; its rain (summer) and fog (winter) patterns have changed. The provincial and district government's response to these epidemic and weather related emergencies have been under scrutiny for the past several years. Environmental policy in many domains depends on effective implementation at the local level, and in turn on the efficacy of local government. The provision of adequate water resources and water quality, presents one of the most far reaching challenges for Lahore. National efforts to assure environmental sustainability in air quality and carbon conservation depend on sustainable transportation as well as regulatory and energy policies at the local level.

- The decisions and actions taken in one of the Lahore's nine towns affect another town or even undermine the decisions of a neighboring town e.g. air pollution, sewerage, garbage disposal, etc. Structured consultation between provincial, elected and local government and between Lahore's towns is the need of the hour to improve this dimension.

ENDNOTES:

1. Lahore Development Authority, *Lahore Urban Development and Traffic Study* (Lahore Development Authority, 1980).
2. Government of the Punjab, Housing and Physical Planning Department, *Master Plan for Greater Lahore* (Lahore: Housing and Physical Planning Department, Government of the Punjab, 1973).
3. O. Nadeem and R. Hameed, "Haphazard Commercialization: A Potential Threat to Sustainable Commercial Development in Metropolitan Cities? The Case of Lahore," *Proceeding of International Conference on Environmentally Sustainable Development*, Abbottabad, Pakistan, 2005.
4. Khalid Hasnain, "Experts see Flaws in Lahore's Master Plan," *Dawn*, 12 May 2012.
5. Khalida Ahson, *Governance and Management in Lahore* (Lahore: Centre for Public Policy and Governance, 2015).
6. O. Nadeem and R. Hameed, "Haphazard Commercialization."
7. Sections 5, 7, 8 and 9 have been reproduced from Khalida Ahson's *Governance and Management in Lahore*.

About Abeeha Islam

Abeeha Islam holds Master in Development Economics and Policy from University of Manchester. She has worked on poverty reduction; gender empowerment; water and sanitation; pro-poor advocacy; and, on rights of religious minorities in Pakistan. She also volunteers for educational projects of various NGOs.

She can be reached at: abeehaislam@hotmail.com

Other Papers in the Series

- Governance and Management in Lahore
- Transport Planning in Lahore
- Water, Sewerage & Solid Waste Management in Lahore
- Real Estate Markets in Lahore
- Improving Trade in Lahore Region

Disclaimer:

This Position Paper is made possible by the support of the American People through United States Agency for International Development (USAID). The contents of this report are the sole responsibility of the author and do not necessarily reflect the views of the United States Government.